

MINUTES
ENOCH CITY PLANNING COMMISSION
April 12, 2022 at 5:30pm
City Council Chambers
City Offices, 900 E. Midvalley Road

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Commissioner Leonard Correa
Commissioner Andy Losee - absent
Commissioner Andrew Meacham
Commissioner Debra Ley
Commissioner Bob Tingey

STAFF PRESENT:

Rob Dotson, City Manager
Council Member Ross
Julie Watson, City Recorder-Zoom
Lindsay Hildebrand-Dep. Rec.
Hayden White-Pub. Works Dir.

PUBLIC PRESENT: Corie Craig, Kerry Fain, Chad Fain, Miles Fain, Alyssa Fain, Ross Chatwin, Cheri Stinson, Dennis Jones, Brenda Killian, Jared Harrington, Larry Brough, Lisa Monson, Julia Lira, Josh Moss, Kirk and Roxi Allen, Katelyn Stinson, Diana, Natalee, and Allissa Elliot, Stephanie Cotham, Dallin Staheli, Trejan Quarnberg, Stephen Neil, Kara and Mike Moreno, Matt Weeb, Bob Platt, Omar Galeano, Gary Hibner, Anthony Colasuono, Sam Crittenden, Justin Charrell, Stephanie Tripp, Chelsey Young, and Kassidee Myers, Chris Wright - Zoom

1. **CALL TO ORDER OF REGULAR MEETING** - By Chairman Tingey at 5:30 pm.
 - a. **Pledge of Allegiance** – Led by Kerry Fain
 - b. **Invocation (2 min.)** – Audience invited to participate - Given by Larry Brough
 - c. **Inspirational thought** - Given by Commissioner Correa
 - d. **Approval of agenda for April 12, 2022** – Commissioner Ley made a motion to approve the agenda. Commissioner Correa seconded and all voted in favor.
 - e. **Approval of minutes for March 22, 2022** - Commissioner Meacham made a motion to approve the minutes. Commissioner Correa seconded with the typographical errors changed and all voted in favor.
 - f. **Conflict of Interest Declaration** - none stated

2. **PUBLIC HEARING FOR PIDDING, LLC FROM SINGLE-FAMILY (R-1-18) TO COMMUNITY COMMERCIAL (C-C)**

Bob Platt said this is a zone change request to create a parcel for an ice skating rink in the Pinnacle Ridge Subdivision area. City Manager Dotson pulled it up on a map. He said the client also sent information about what will be happening in the future. He explained which roads will be vacated and dedicated to the City. Enoch Blvd. is new and he explained how it will fit into the area.

Commissioner Ley made a motion to close the regular Planning Commission meeting and open a public hearing for Pidding, LLC zone change from Single-Family Residential (R-1-18) to Community Commercial (C-C). Commissioner Meacham seconded and all voted in favor.

Chairman Tingey invited the public to comment or ask questions.

Stephen Neil lives on Village Green Rd. He expressed that he wanted to keep the zone residential because there is already a lot of traffic there. He is all for an ice rink, but not in that neighborhood. He moved out to Village Green Subdivision to get away from an HOA. He doesn't mind having commercial businesses; however he thought somewhere near the Enoch soccer field would be a better location. He was also concerned about the traffic flow.

Chris Wright commented on Zoom. He said there are thousands of acres of land in this area. He noted the high-end housing development to the west. He was worried about all of the noise that might happen. He thought the placement is inappropriate with the current area development. He mentioned all of the things that might go there and he is concerned about the effect it will have on the current residents.

Megan Stead said she has property in Village Green Farms Subdivision and she thinks it would be fun and an improvement to the neighborhood. She mentioned the zoning map has commercial areas all around.

Dallin Staheli said he's a resident and was involved with the ice rink in Cedar City for several years. He mentioned that it's an opportunity of a lifetime. The rink in Cedar City was in a very nice neighborhood and it was just fine. It didn't cause any problems. He wanted the Planning Commission to consider what this opportunity would bring to Enoch. It will be very popular, but not like a Wal-Mart Supercenter. It would be an improvement to Enoch.

Trejan Quarnberg said he used to live off of Ravine Rd. They just moved about a year ago and when they found out about this, they felt sad that they missed out. This would be something unique. He understood the argument of location and the traffic it would create, but it's been a dream of his to have something like this in the City. He said it would set Enoch apart from Cedar City. The closest rink is two hours in any direction. However, he mentioned the proposed location was not his number one choice.

Kerry Fain said she is spearheading this project. She appreciated the opportunity of being heard. She respects every comment and understands there may be a more desirable place but they are expensive. The way Enoch is growing, they have to bring in and create options for a better quality of life. Not only will they bring in more tax revenue to upgrade roads and hire Police Officers, they will also pay impact fees and taxes. They will purchase water rights as well. They don't want to lay it on the backs of the taxpayers so this property is being donated and made so people can have more things to do. They would be at the disposal of the community. There is a large parking lot planned so if Enoch wants to do other projects, they may be able to. This gives the kids a chance to pursue hockey, ice skating, etc. She wanted to thank everyone for their time.

Justin Chappell said he is worried about bringing more commercial into the area in the future. He wondered what kind of traffic this might bring. He also wonders about the homes on the northside of Village Green homes dealing with an island of commercial in a residential area.

David Platt said he is a retired law enforcement officer and no good comes with changing residential to commercial. It always brings headaches. When there are functions going on at the Stake Center, people will speed down Heather Hue. There are other commercial properties all up and down Highway 91. He was also worried about noise.

Alisa Fain wanted to note that there will be a six-foot privacy wall around the rink. She hoped this would solve the potential noise concern.

Nathan Breinholt said he moved a year and a half ago to Cedar City. He moved by the lake on the hill and the noise and potential concerns are not as bad as people think. It's a huge opportunity to Enoch and the community all around.

Stephanie Tripp said she lives in Enoch and thanked everyone for their input. She voiced her support for having the rink here. She said the children could use something in the community to do. She drives her child twice a week into Cedar and we need stuff out here to do. It makes for a happier healthier life.

Brenda Killian said the idea is wonderful, but also lives in Village Green and is concerned about the traffic and things that may happen in the neighborhood. If it does pass, she hopes that a lot of time and effort goes into keeping it nice.

Ross Chatwin said he has some land between Foster's Market and Gateway Preparatory Academy. It already has some commercial property and could be a better location.

Gary Hibner lives on Ravine Rd. He didn't invest in the area for it to become commercially zoned. He doesn't want the commercial property in the middle of the residential area. Old Highway 91 or Minersville Highway would be fine, but the neighborhood of Village Green Subdivision has a lot of kids. There is already a lot of traffic due to the Stake Center. Commercial property would use a lot more water.

Chairman Tingey read a letter from Holly Haymond who is in opposition to zoning the property commercially.

Spencer Jones said that he has heard a common denominator of concerns that he wants to be sensitive to the concerns. From the northeast corner of the proposed ice rink over to Village Green Rd is a ¼ mile away so that there is a significant buffer between homes and the ice rink. Also from the ice rink to Heather Hue is 4/10s of a mile. The barrier that was discussed about the block wall will be there and regarding the concerns of Heather Hue and Village Green Road being busy, there will be three roads that will disperse from the ice rink.

Kerry Fain wanted to address any light pollution concerns. When the ice rink was in Cedar City, they did testing from lights at the parking lot and rink. It was found that there was double light from the street lights rather than the ice rink.

Commissioner Correa made a motion to close the public hearing and return to the regular meeting. Commissioner Meacham seconded and all voted in favor.

3. CONSIDER A ZONE CHANGE REQUEST FOR PIDDING, LLC AND MAKE A RECOMMENDATION TO THE CITY COUNCIL

Chairman Tingey said that there is a common theme of everyone likes the idea but not the location. Commissioner Correa said it was hard to visualize the concept and he knows one of the property owners who spoke will benefit from the changes. Commissioner Meacham said they are faced with the decision about the zone change and not what will be used for. This is an opportunity of a lifetime for Enoch City. Chairman Tingey noted this is not being paid for by the community. Commissioner Ley's concern was regarding the residents of Village Green subdivision who thought the current residential zone would stay residential when they purchased their property. She feels for the community because it has always been historically residential. She wanted to visualize where the new road would go. Spencer Jones spoke on Zoom and explained that Enoch Blvd is the new road and he told how it will tie into Pinnacle Way and Ravine Rd. Commissioner Meacham said even without considering the ice rink, the roads will benefit everyone. Some concerns are light, sound, and traffic. City Manager Dotson said we have laws to control potential sound and light issues. There was more discussion about the pros and cons. Chairman Tingey said it seems the developer is really trying to mitigate the potential problems. Commissioner Ley asked if the City can mitigate some of the concerns. City Manager Dotson explained the Dark Sky Ordinance adding the Police Department can check the noise levels. They are required to put a fence between a residential zone and the Community Commercial zone. There is a shortage of water, but we have two new wells coming online. Commissioner Tingey noted there was an article in the St. George News and one positive point is they are working to recycle as much water as possible. City Manager Dotson said they do have to provide the City with water rights.

Commissioner Correa made a motion to send a favorable recommendation to City Council to consider a zone change request for Pidding, LLC. Commissioner Meacham seconded the motion and all voted in favor.

4. PUBLIC HEARING ON THE MATHESON PROPERTY ZONE CHANGE FROM SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENTIAL (R-1-18) TO SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENTIAL (R-1-11)

Commissioner Ley made a motion to close the regular meeting and open the public hearing on the Matheson property zone change request. Commissioner Meacham seconded the motion and all voted in favor.

Omar Galliano lives on Matheson Rd. He has a daughter that wants to move here and she can't afford to do that. The ½ acre lots would be impossible but ¼ acre would be more doable. She has a job at SUU. He is concerned about more than doubling the traffic and water consumption. As much as he wants his daughter to get a place to live, he isn't sure about the water. Where are we going to get the water? He is against it only from the water standpoint. He thinks making the lots half of the size would double noise, water use, traffic, etc. He believes that we should have more R-1-11 and it helps the city grow a little bit.

Connie Hurley said she lives on the corner of Sagewood and Sarah Ave. She is also concerned about water. There are little kids running the neighborhood and she said the size of the neighborhood will triple and with limited access pushing traffic to Sagewood and Matheson Way. That land is lower in elevation. She owned 3 lots and they had to bring in fill dirt after the flooding.

Wade Wilcock, who is the agent for the Matheson's said they will start at 18,000 SF lots and go to 11,000 SF lots closer to SR-130. It will be a mixture of sizes with none smaller than the 11,000 SF required in the R-1-11 zone. There will be enough water with the property to be brought into the City for development as required by City Code. The correct engineering is happening regarding roads and stormwater. At the north end of the subdivision, there will be a master-planned road that will enter from SR-130 and continue east and west. Commissioner Meacham clarified there will be some half-acre lots mixed in on the west. Wade said it is planned for 63 lots in the first phase. Chairman Tingey said he knows from past experience this will be required to comply with current ordinances. The roads required to come with the number of homes planned per Code.

Megan Stead said her generation is in big trouble. It's unheard of to be able to afford anything. Smaller lots could make this more affordable.

Commissioner Meacham made a motion to close the public hearing and return to the regular meeting. Commissioner Ley seconded the motion and all voted in favor.

5. CONSIDER ZONE CHANGE REQUEST FOR THE MATHESON PROPERTY AND MAKE A RECOMMENDATION TO THE CITY COUNCIL

Commissioner Chairman Tingey said the only real concern from the public is the water availability. This concern has come up before. Two new wells will be going in and the owner will have to bring water rights per Code in order to develop.

Commissioner Ley motioned to send a favorable recommendation to the City Council to consider the zone change request for the Matheson property from R-1-18 to R-1-11. Commissioner Correa seconded the motion and all voted in favor.

6. PUBLIC HEARING FOR MEGA RV STORAGE FROM SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENTIAL (R-1-18) TO COMMUNITY COMMERCIAL (C-C)

Commissioner Ley made a motion to close the regular meeting and open a public hearing for the Mega RV storage zone change from R-1-18 to C-C.

Bob Platt recapped the issues from past meetings. The situation is Mr. Emerson met with the concerned owners and worked out the issues they had. He is committed to doing what benefits them and him.

Lester Ross said he was one of the concerned property owners. He has met with Mr. Emerson and he has agreed to do a landscaping buffer between the commercial and the residential property. He also agreed to follow city ordinances regarding light pollution and use motion detectors.

Bob Platt noted the annexation of this piece of property is moving forward in another process and this will be built conforming in accordance with the requirements of the zone. There was a discussion on what constitutes "community commercial". That is businesses that can co-exist with nearby residential.

Commissioner Meacham made a motion to close the public hearing and return to the regular meeting. Commissioner Correa seconded the motion and all voted in favor.

7. CONSIDER ZONE CHANGE REQUEST FOR MEGA RV AND MAKE A RECOMMENDATION TO THE CITY COUNCIL

Commissioner Meacham said it seems pretty favorable and issues have been resolved.

Commissioner Ley made a motion to send a favorable recommendation to the City Council to consider a zone change request for Mega RV from R-1-18 to C-C. Commissioner Correa seconded the motion and all voted in favor.

8. ORDINANCE NO. 2022-05-04-A AN ORDINANCE AMENDING THE ENOCH CITY RECREATIONAL VEHICLE PARK (RVP) ORDINANCE, CHAPTER 12.3000, AND SET A PUBLIC HEARING FOR APRIL 26, 2022

Megan Stead came up to discuss the reasons this has come up before the Planning Commission. She said they bought the property and due to some circumstances with building the home they wanted they decided they want to create a little RV Park. The problem is the current ordinance says it has to be two (2) acres. Their property is 1.3 acres. They tried to buy more property or trade for the property by them on Hwy. 91 but nearby properties are all less than two (2) acres. She showed a map of their proposed RV Park. They also want to make the allowable stay time for more than the four (4) months as shown as 122 days currently allowed in the ordinance. She said the reason for that is more and more people need longer to build new homes or to work out their circumstances to be able to buy a home. This RV Park could enable them to live affordably while they work things out. Commissioner Ley said the longer-term makes it more like a permanent mobile home park. Megan said she called all the RV parks around to ask about the time limits on how long people could stay and they said they have no time limits. After some discussion, the Commission decided the long term was not a needed change. Commissioner Ley asked about the house pet stipulations. There was a discussion on household and non-household pets. Chairman Tingey cited concerns about others wanting to do this all over the City with little dabs of property if the changes were allowed. Commissioner Correa expressed concerns down the line with the same issues. Commissioner Meacham said it's in a great location. Commissioner Correa said he visualizes one acre as a problem regarding access and turnaround in the RV Park. There was more discussion about the size. Megan said in their case there will be two accesses; one from Hwy 91 and the other on the west side of the property. A road that people can drive through solves the problems noted. Commissioner Meacham said if they can make it work on this piece of property, then who are we to tell them that they can't. It's in the proper area for a zone change on Hwy.91. Council Member Ross noted there is a limit on where you can put this type of development written in the Recreational Vehicle Park development standards that requires two accesses. That will limit where this can be done. Most lots don't have two accesses. Commissioner Ley said she prefers leaving the stay time for 122 days. If they want to stay longer, they can re-up. Commissioner Ley said she isn't sure if they should be able to have chickens. Megan asked about the wording regarding putting in a bathroom facility in the RV Park.

There was a brief discussion of different circumstances that would make this a good idea for many reasons. Council Member Ross asked what the water rights requirements are. Hayden White, Public Works Director, said it is one water right per nine (9) RVs. Commissioner Ley asked about the private trash container? Megan said Enoch City will not provide trash pickup, so they will hire a commercial service for that as required for all commercial businesses.

Commissioner Ley made a motion to set a public hearing for April 26 for Ordinance No. 2022-05-04-A, an ordinance amending the Enoch city Recreational Vehicle Park (RVP) Ordinance with the added changes as discussed. Commissioner Correa seconded the motion and all voted in favor.

9. ORDINANCE NO. 2022-05-04-B AN ORDINANCE AMENDING THE ENOCH CITY ORDINANCE, CHAPTER 12.2500.2502, MINOR SUBDIVISION AND CHAPTER 12.2600.2602, MAJOR SUBDIVISION, IMPROVEMENTS, AND SET A PUBLIC HEARING FOR APRIL 26, 2022

To clarify, Larry Brough came up to speak saying he came upon an issue when talking about a minor subdivision. It involves deleting one sentence. It takes away the requirement that all lots front onto a dedicated road. He noted he intends to create a minor subdivision where the lots will have access through a private road that is 25 ft. wide. They propose this change due to precedence already created throughout the City in other minor subdivisions. He said he can't think of any downsides to this action. He went on to explain his future minor subdivision is being created so other family members can return to live with family already here. City Manager Dotson said the only issue is the public utility easement is on the main access road. They would have to extend the utility easement down the private access road. Also when and if that road ever gets dedicated to the City it has to be brought up to City road standards, which is typical.

City Manager Dotson said the remainder of the changes is for major subdivisions. An engineer has to provide a comprehensive drainage study. We don't have a retention basin standard currently. We have developers now who want to build retention basins. It's all going to be based on engineering. Commissioner Ley asked who decides which type of basin you get. City Manager Dotson said the developer chooses. He explained what is required for a retention basin. At this point, we don't even have an engineering drawing but we can get one. There was discussion and questions about retention basin requirements that will come in the future as a standard is developed. The need is coming with growth. The main point is retention basins have to have soil conditions that allow for water to be held for a longer period of time which is two days. Detention basins slow water while it moves on to other areas rather than holding it in place. Commissioner Correa said item F seems to be low at 42 inches high. He thought it should be 72 inches. Doug Grimshaw said he used to survey in Las Vegas and they had a requirement that rooftop water and land water had to go into the backyard. Every yard was required to have a retention capability.

City Manager Dotson went over item E under Improvements. He explained impact fees go into a big pot. He gave the example of Pineview Estates which needed a 10" line for their water. We paid the difference in cost to upsize the line for future growth and we were able to use impact fees in the instance. The developer has to go to Ensign Engineering and pay to have their water system modeled. This puts it into code to require that. We don't currently have a model for our sewer. An 8-inch sewer line for ½ inch slope will handle 800 homes. We are starting to get some of these sewer lines with a lot of homes on them. We have no requirements to model what that looks like moving downstream. Impact fees could pay for a percentage of a loan or grant to develop a model and we are seeing a need for that sewer model now. Our sewer system is averaging about 60% capacity so no need to be worried but we need to plan for the future.

City Manager Dotson went over the item I in the amended ordinance. This is subjective and needs to be removed. For streetlights, he added item L. He always thought Rocky Mountain Power maintained all the streetlights, but some maintenance has fallen to the City because developers did not use RMP-approved streetlights. Now, with this change, the developer will be responsible for maintenance through Rocky Mountain Power.

Commissioner Ley asked about water retention basins saying the requirements seem to be much more complete than the detention basin requirements. City Manager Dotson said that is because detention basins only slow water and don't retain it so there isn't a lot to it and there is no need for more requirements. Commissioner Meacham asked if the minimum height for a fence around the retention ponds should be 72 inches. City Manager Dotson talked about liability regarding fences. If you look at all of the new subdivisions, six (6) foot fences have gone in. The dilemma is if a pond is fenced by the City and there is an accident then the City is liable. If there is no fence the City has no liability.

Commissioner Meacham made a motion to set a public hearing for April 26, 2022, for consideration of Ordinance No. 2022-05-04-B regarding changes to minor and major subdivisions. Commissioner Ley seconded the motion and all voted in favor.

10. CONSIDER THE ZONE CHANGE FOR THE HARDIN-CHATWIN PROPERTY FROM SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENTIAL (R-1-18) TO SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENTIAL (R-1-11) AND SET A PUBLIC HEARING FOR APRIL 26, 2022

Ross Chatwin said this is 280 acres they are asking to rezone from R-1-18 to R-1-11 allowing for smaller lots. They are also looking at affordable housing. They will be made out of concrete and possible garden top roofs. Chairman Tingey clarified to say this is west of Minersville Hwy. City Manager Dotson pulled it up on the screen saying many areas near this are already R-1-11. Commissioner Ley asked if there are more wells going in. Ross said there are two wells on the property now. He has enough water rights to develop the entire place. He added potentially rainwater would be recycled to use on the vegetation.

Commissioner Ley made a motion to set a public hearing for April 26, 2022, for a zone change for the Hardin-Chatwin zone change from R-1-18 to R-1-11. Commissioner Meacham seconded the motion and all voted in favor.

11. PUBLIC COMMENTS – There were no public comments.

12. COMMISSION/STAFF REPORTS

Council Member Ross reported we are talking about budgets in City Council. She noted two Planning Commission members were reappointed.

13. ADJOURN – Commissioner Correa made a motion to adjourn. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Ley and all voted in favor. The meeting ended at 8:35 pm.

 4-27-22
Lindsay Hildebrand, Dep. Recorder Date Meeting ID: 812 0463 5796