MINUTES
OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION OF TOOELE COUNTY HELD DECEMBER 7, 2021

Chairman Tripp called the meeting to order at 6:45 pm. The time, place and agenda of the meeting had been provided to the Tooele Transcript Bulletin and to each member of the governing body by posting the notice and agenda at least two days before on the Tooele County website and emailing them a link.

1. **CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL.** Council Chair Tripp called the meeting to order at 6:45 PM. Present at the meeting were Council Members Tom Tripp, Chair, Scott Wardle, Tye Hoffmann, Kendall Thomas, and Jared Hammer. Also present were Tracy Shaw, County Clerk, Rachelle Custer, Community Development Director, Andy Welch, County Manager, and Colin Winchester, Deputy Attorney.

   Members of the Public and County Staff: Jess Clifford, Small Business Development Center, Jake Parkinson, Assessor, Tim Gillie, Transcript Bulletin, Brian White, Chief Deputy Sheriff, Paul Wimmer, Sheriff, Chris Sloan, Paul Hacking, Tooele Technical College, and Wayne Anderton, Solid Waste Director.

2. **MINUTES**

   A) **MINUTES FROM OCTOBER 5, 2021, BOARD OF EQUALIZATION MEETING.** Council Member Thomas motioned to approve the minutes. Council Member Hamner seconded the motion. All in favor. The motion carries.

3. **2021 ABATEMENT ADJUSTMENTS**

   2021 TOOELE COUNTY ABATEMENTS Alison McCoy, Auditor presented this item. There are 4 types of Abatement Programs in the county: Veterans, Circuit Breaker, Indigent and Active Military. The County is required to give the Circuit Breaker and Veterans Abatements if the individual meets the requirements. Auditor McCoy gave the Council Members a list of everyone in the County who met the requirements for an abatement so they could see where we ended up for the year. The State reimburses the County for the Circuit Breaker Abatements, but the other types are not reimbursed. Council Member Tripp asked what the criteria for the Circuit Breaker is. Auditor McCoy advised the applicant must be at least 66 years old and make under $34,666 a year. We have submitted approximately $300,000 to the state for reimbursement. At the first of the year, once the Treasurer has done the rest of the collecting, we will resubmit to the State. The Treasurer's office had a meeting with Auditor McCoy earlier today and let her know they are about 90% collected. Council Member Hoffmann asked about the other 1.6 million. Auditor McCoy responded that we do have to take the cost. Council Member Wardle asked if we had that in the budget. Auditor McCoy responded that we plan for that in the budget. Council Member Tripp asked for clarification on the Circuit Breaker and the Market Circuit Breaker. Auditor McCoy explained that if an individual gets the Circuit Breaker Abatement, they automatically get the Market Circuit Breaker. The Market Circuit Breaker is the County's portion of the abatement. We give them a 20% discount off the market value of their property then apply that to the taxable portion. Council Member Tripp noted that on the table Auditor McCoy provided, it showed that we have 1,424 abatements totaling to approximately $1.9 million dollars. Auditor McCoy confirmed. Council Member Hoffmann motioned to acknowledge the examined Circuit Breaker, Veterans, and Indigent Abatement tax adjustments for this year. Council Member Hamner seconded the motion. All in favor. The motion carries.

4. **<u>2021 NOTICE OF CORRECTIONS.</u>** Council Chair Tripp introduces these items.

A) **<u>REAL PROPERTY ADJUSTMENTS</u>** Council Chair Tripp explains that a piece of federal government property was assessed for $178 by accident. We must give that money back. Council Member Wardle motioned to deal with the real property adjustment of $178. Council Member Thomas seconded the motion. All in favor. The motion carries.

B) **<u>BOE PROTEST PARCELS</u>** Jake Parkinson, Assessor, began to present, but Auditor McCoy pointed out that he was presenting item 4C. Auditor McCoy presented item 4B- BOE Protest Parcels. She advised that Board of Equalization protests are people who are coming into our offices and actively protesting the value that their property was assessed. The Assessor's office has stipulated these values, looked them over and come up with what they think and have come to an agreement with these people. Some of the people have met with a hearing officer and come to an agreement on the values of the properties. Auditor McCoy then referenced back to 4C.

C) **<u>PARCEL CORRECTIONS</u>** Jake Parkinson, Assessor, presented parcel corrections. These are corrections that his office found when the tax roll was closed. This is something that occurs each year and they expect to have more in the next month or two. Some of the mistakes are as simple as the property being double taxed by the County and the State, or the property was valued as if it was not land locked, so we had to add the influence on it which makes the property worth less if you do not have access to it. Different mistakes that were made when setting the values and those who come in and appeal. Council Member Hoffmann asked if four pages of parcel corrections was standard. Assessor Parkinson answered that this is not standard and explained the process that his office has done. At the beginning of the year, they did a detailed review on the outlying areas of the county. These outlying areas had not been used in the CAMAS system before. The CAMAS system is the evaluation system the Assessor's office uses. As the information was being inputted into the CAMAS system, there was more human error than should be expected. Assessor Parkinson advised this is not typical, but now that they are in the system, there isn't a process of going back to square one. An extensive amount of data verification was run on the errors and having more licenses of ARC will help prevent this issue from reoccurring in the future. Typically, in an average year, there will be 200 appeals and 500 corrections, which is still a significant amount. Auditor McCoy gave credit to Assessor Parkinson and his team. She advised that since she has been here, there have been a dozen or so cases go before a hearing officer. This year they have had very few cases go before a hearing officer, which means Assessor Parkinson and his team have done a great job working with the citizens and coming up with an agreement before it goes to a hearing officer. Council Member Thomas motioned to approve items 4B and 4C. Council Member Hoffmann seconded the motion. All in favor. The motion carries.

5. **<u>ATI TITANIUM AGREEMENT WITH TOOELE COUNTY - PRESENTED BY JAKE PARKINSON, TOOELE COUNTY ASSESSOR</u>**

A) **<u>ATI TITANIUM AGREEMENT WITH TOOELE COUNTY</u>** Jake Parkinson, Assessor, presented this item. ATI has been closed for six years. An appraisal was done six years ago which cost the County quite a bit. ATI appealed in July 2021 and asked the County to lower the appraised value to $20 million. The County approached the original appraiser and asked him for an update on the property. He advised the County to take the $20 million agreement and that is what was done. Council Member Wardle questioned paragraph 1 in the settlement agreement which shows the value at $15 million. Assessor Parkinson responded that the $15 million would be the value for 2022, as part of the settlement agreement. Council Member Wardle also questioned paragraph 2 and asked if the value of the property would stay the same if ATI were to lease or sell the property to a third party. Assessor

Parkinson responded that if the ATI plant was to go active, the value would go up the following year. Statute hinges on if it is active or dark on January 1st; it will stay that way for the entire year. Council Member Wardle states his concern with paragraph 2 subset 1, quoting "ATI does not develop or announce before January 1, 2022, plans to restart its titanium plant." Council Member Wardle asks if ATI sells or assigns it to someone else after January 1st is this assignable to someone else. Assessor Parkinson responds that his understanding is it would not. He defers to Colin Winchester, Attorney, to answer that question. Attorney Winchester states that if anyone were to restart the plant then the value would change. Council Member Hoffmann clarified that it wouldn't happen until the following year. Auditor McCoy states that it would be whatever it looked like with the new owner on January 1, 2022. Assessor Parkinson states that if they go into production or use it for another use, then the County would reappraise it for the 2023 tax year. Council Member Tripp states that the initial capital investment into ATI was 450 million dollars. The County is only getting about 3% of the capital value with what we are appraising it at right now. Council Member Wardle states his concern that if ATI signs this agreement, then on January 2, 2022, they sell to a new company, then the new company invests January 3, 2022, then this is what their appraised value will be for 2022. He is concerned that the County will have a problem with taxes during that year. It is almost as if giving them an incentive to come and invest. Council Member Tripp states he would like them to invest if it is something that is good for the county. Council Member Wardle argues that he understands that we want to give incentives, but he points out that ATI walked away within weeks after making these agreements, resulting in the school board and others not receiving money because of the agreements. Council Member Wardle reiterated that he wants to make sure that this is on the record. Council Member Hoffmann motioned to accept the proposed agreement from ATI to fix the appraised value for 2022. Council Member Thomas seconded the motion. All in favor. The motion carries.

6. **ADJOURN** Council Member Hamner motions to adjourn at 7:03 PM. Council Member Wardle seconded motion. All in favor. The motion carries.

THE FOREGOING MINUTES ARE HEREBY APPROVED:

BY: ________________ 4/11/2022
TOM TRIPP, CHAIRMAN

ATTEST:

BY: ________________
TRACY SHAW, COUNTY CLERK

COUNTY OF TOOELE
COUNTY CLERK
STATE OF UTAH