

NOTICE OF MEETING
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
CITY OF ST. GEORGE
WASHINGTON COUNTY, UTAH
October 20, 2021

PRESENT: Bob Nicholson, Member
Rick Atkin, Member
Scott Messel, Member

EXCUSED: Allan Carter, Member
Bette Arial, Chair

CITY STAFF: John Willis, Community Development Director
Carol Davidson, Planner III
Bryan Pack, Civil City Attorney
Brenda Hatch, Development Services Office Manager

The agenda for the meeting is as follows:

Scott Messel nominated Bob Nicholson as pro tempore chair, seconded by Rick Atkin. Unanimous, motion carries. Pro tempore chair Nicholson called the meeting to order at 12:11 pm

1. LANDMARK SITE DESIGNATION

Consider a request to designate the home at 179 West 200 North as a landmark site to be known as the Junius and Margaret Ann Barton Home.

Carol Davidson presented the following:

Carol Davidson showed where the home is located in the Arts District. Pictures were shown of the home in the past and present.

Carol Davidson – The house was built in 1949. The applicant provided a lot of information in the narrative (included in the packet). Carol recited the requirements for designation. The applicant feels like the home meets the category of events; they believe it has added to the history of the City of St. George during the post WWII era. This staff report was hard for me to write, the applicant provided a lot of information. It all goes to interpretation of whether you feel this meets an event. I went through the designations of the landmark book that we have and most of them are designated with the architectural one, there were some that had important people associated with them. The only ones I could find that had events associated with them were the commercial buildings like the Social Hall, the Opera House, and the Tabernacle.

Tyler Witwer – This was a tough one because we felt like it could fit under events, person, or architecture. This home was my grandparents' house. We purchased it from the estate to preserve it. My great grandfather built a number of homes in this area during that time. We didn't know if we should have tied it to the people, family members that grew up in this house and contributed as business owners and City Council members to the City of St. George.

Pro tempore chair Nicholson – Tell us again who you thought would qualify it under F. significant person.

Tyler Witwer – Leo Barton was my grandfather's father. They built this home together, but Leo also built about approximately 50 homes in the Southern Utah area during the 40's and 50's. We listed some of the homes that he helped build in the narrative. There are not many homes that had someone live in it for 69 years and all of the children that lived in this house are still in the City of St. George. They have played roles in developing Southern Utah.

Pro tempore chair Nicholson – This one is hard; it is a little like the last one. I guess it is significant because it represented a small, typical simple home from the 1940's and 50's in St. George.

Scott Messel – I like that it still has the wood shake and the original windows as well.

Tyler Witwer – We don't want this type of home to disappear in this area.

Rick Atkin – Yes, it could be really subjective. Less subjective would be the architecture. That would convince me to preserve it. There were important people that lived in and built the home but the precedent that we had before were people that were more like Mayors or went on to national notoriety. Do you know what type of architecture it is?

Pro tempore chair Nicholson – I don't know if they call it cottage or craftsman.

Scott Messel – If these types of homes disappear on the street what effect will it have on the more famous homes on that street? I want to preserve it for the street scape. I want to keep the neighborhood intact.

Discussion continued on whether the home should be considered as a historical landmark.

Pro tempore chair Nicholson – One thing they could do is remove the short-term rental as a use for the landmarks.

Carol Davidson – Unfortunately the discussion is that most people that fix up those homes and keep them looking good is because they want to do short term rental.

Rick Atkin – Short term rental is a bigger conversation; I am struggling why people have concern with it. Especially because people actually are keeping up their homes. People are being able to afford living in their homes because they can rent out accessory dwelling unit. I think maybe we have gone too extreme on preventing short term rentals. It's a very welcoming experience for people to stay in a home downtown. I don't have any problem with them. The issue in my neighborhood isn't short term rentals, it's the people that are renting long term.

Collin Simonsen- We need to make sure we don't go beyond the committee's purview and become a little Planning Commission, we need to base the sole decision on the criteria and not the short-term rental.

Carol Davidson – So they definitely meet the first 3, it's down to the 5 and whether or not this commission feels they meet it or not.

Tyler Witwer – We want to preserve it forever.

Pro tempore chair Nicholson – Carol is right, there are a lot of houses in the area that are like this. It is indicative of the small, basic dwellings in St. George, and it is part of the fabric of that neighborhood.

Rick Atkin – Is this a block style building?

Tyler Witwer – It is block.

MOTION: Rick Atkin made a motion to recommend approval of a landmark site, it meets all 3 of the criteria it meets the architecture as a block style cottage.

SECOND: Scott Messel

AYES: (3)

Bob Nicholson, Member

Rick Atkin, Member

Scott Messel, Member

NAYS: (0)

Motion Carries

2. **DISCUSSION ITEM**

Discussion on restoration of historic buildings

Carol Davidson – We wanted to talk about the Pymm House, this was the old post office and at some point and time it was changed. It kind of looks like it's the same building but at some point they replaced the roof, changed out the windows. The building we see today has nothing from the original. So, the question when they came to PSR was would you rather have us put this back like it was supposed to be or take it down and then do something modern? We don't want faux historical.

Matt Glendenning – If you peak through the window on the top you can see some old trusses. We haven't been able to look at them to see how old they are because of asbestos issues. We would love to pay homage to the old building and then juxtapose on the east side with a modern building.

Doug Glendenning – With it sandwiched between the Electric Theater, it would preserve the front and then add the modern structure on the back.

Matt Glendenning – So the question now is there is not much similarity to the historic photos, is it really historic or is there just a plaque on there?

John Willis – Do you know when they made the modifications?

Matt Glendenning – No, we think on the east side it looks like CMU, slab on grade probably 70's, 80's type of construction, no clue.

Discussion on the modifications and what might still be historic in the building.

Pro tempore chair Nicholson – Is the second story set back a bit?

Matt Metcalf – The second story goes back about a foot or two.

Rick Atkin – I know that Bette feels similar as we don't want faux historical. I would like to see what the feeling of the Planning Commission is, I would like to see outdoor spaces with patios and decks and things like that.

Discussion on roof patio and outdoor public spaces.

Scott Messel – Having windows on the side with the alley makes it more friendly, I'm a fan.

Pro tempore chair Nicholson – Two stories is appropriate for that area.

Rick Atkin – I like the plan a lot.

3. **MINUTES**

Consider approval of the August 18, 2021, meeting minutes.

MOTION: Scott Messel moved to approve the minutes from the August 18, 2021, meeting.

SECOND: Rick Atkin

AYES: (3)

Bob Nicholson, Member

Rick Atkin, Member

Scott Messel, Member

NAYS: (0)

Motion Carries

4. **ADJOURN**

MOTION: Rick Atkin made a motion to adjourn at 12:50 pm

SECOND: Scott Messel

AYES: (3)

Bob Nicholson, Member

Rick Atkin, Member

Scott Messel, Member

NAYS: (0)

Motion Carries