

NOTICE OF MEETING
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
CITY OF ST. GEORGE
WASHINGTON COUNTY, UTAH
June 16, 2021

PRESENT: Bette Arial, Chair
Bob Nicholson, Member
Rick Atkin, Member
Scott Messel, Member
Allan Carter, Member

EXCUSED:

CITY STAFF: John Willis, Community Development Director
Carol Davidson, Planner III
Bryan Pack, Civil City Attorney
Brenda Hatch, Development Services Office Manager

The agenda for the meeting is as follows:

Chair Bette Arial called the meeting to order at 12:02 pm.

1. LANDMARK SITE DESIGNATION

Consider a request to designate the home at 274 South 200 West as a landmark site to be known as the Sevy Home.

Carol Davidson presented the following:

Carol Davidson – The slide shows a pamphlet of existing granaries the pamphlet was produced in 2008.

Cimmaron Chacon – And I think at least four of those that are marked are gone.

Carol Davidson – The house was built in 1938 as a 2-bedroom 1 bathroom house. The granary on the property is now used as a laundry room. There have been additions made to the home.

Chair Arial – We need to take into consideration that the homes in this were built in stages.

Carol Davidson – Showed photos of the home at different stages of the additions.

Cimmaron – I came as close to the original colors on the inside and outside as I could.

Carol Davidson – Showed a comparison photo to show what Cimmaron has done to the home.

Cimmaron – The house had the old windows, I put one of those original windows in the living room inside. We ordered Marvin windows which are a good replication. The door in the picture was added in the 50's.

Carol Davidson – It must meet all of the A, B, and C of the code. There have been some alterations to the exterior, I did list them, and I guess it's up to you to decide whether it was

significant alterations. g is it embodies distinctive characteristics; the granary is still there, and you can discuss it to see.

Cimmaron Chacon – I worked closely with Kirk and Bob back in the day to make sure that the renovations were done correctly, the renovations that we did were major. The plumbing hadn't been upgraded; the wiring hadn't been upgraded when we moved in there. The previous owners had turned it into a rental, they took out half of a bearing wall. They chopped it up to add a bedroom. We first had to do a stabilization project, working with the Utah Heritage Foundation, I wanted to make sure that we not only preserved the house, but that we brought it back. It was quite fascinating when we went through that process. It was vernacular built. They put the fireplace on the subfloor without a foundation. We left the original fireplace in place so we would have it. We found out that the whole house is sitting on temple rock. I have the original claw foot tub in my bathroom. We found original paint colors in the walls, scraped off so that we could preserve it. It was a tear down when we bought it. I thought there were 4 houses left like this in town, but I only found 3.

Rick Atkin – Is it adobe or timber?

Cimmaron Chacon – It is timber, they brought it down from Carmel Junction through the Zion tunnel. I met the son of the original builder.

Bob Nicholson – So this property was vacant until 1938 when the home was built, were not sure when the granary was built. It does say that the land was owned in 1892 by Joseph Young who was at the time the Mayor of St. George, St. George Stake President, and a member of the legislature.

Allan Carter – Joseph Young granted most of the patents in the St. George area.

Chair Bette Arial – I live on the hill over there and I've learned to love some of the little homes. I was excited to see this project. When Joule Plaza was being built I had an office over there and I used to walk around at lunch time. I only found a few that should have been kept. There are some historic significance in these little homes that should be kept, just because they are not 2 story and with the chimneys on both sides.

Rick Atkin – I would love to hear from you what about the designation you are looking for?

Cimmaron Chacon – I have been talking to Bob about this for a while. One of the reasons are I can use it as a vacation rental. This May my dad was diagnosed with throat cancer, and we thought we would have to spend a lot of time to take care of him. It turns out they found a treatment and he's in remission. But I started looking at what we could do. I have put a lot into it, it is just as much the Chacon house as it is the Sevy house. I don't want to sell it and not have it loved.

Allan Carter – I'm going to talk both sides of this. I think that the property was the original mayor's home, who granted most of the patents in St. George. I think the granary is pre-1900's. I appreciate your feelings for the home. I feel like we need to be careful with what we focus on. We don't want to open it up to homes built in the 1930's and water down what we are trying to do. I think we need to focus on the granary.

John Willis – I think you bring up good points, many of these applications we are seeing is to get a short-term rental. That's why the criteria is so important. Maybe that's a discussion as an item on an agenda.

Chair Bette Arial – How does that work as a short-term rental?

Carol Davidson – It's a conditional use permit.

Discussion continued regarding short term rentals

John Willis – I think you have to look at it in the sense that yes, this is so important of a house that we want to preserve it and we don't mind giving it a short-term rental.

Cimmaron Chacon – There is a lack of short-term rentals in the downtown area. So, I kind of look at this as we want to, one of the things of making a walkable community is that your visitors can't walk. If someone was going to rent my house they would be able to walk and participate in the ironman or to a restaurant downtown.

Rick Atkin – I don't have a problem with the short-term rentals, especially the Airbnb, they do it really well. Think of downtown Boise.

Discussion continued on short term rentals and the pros and cons.

John Willis – I think the important thing is that we focus on the criteria for the landmark status and make sure we feel comfortable with those.

Bob Nicholson – I give a lot of credit to Kirk, one thing he points out that makes it special is its size. Most of these homes are teardowns. I think the Landmark program is a good incentive to keep some of these homes even though they are teardowns. I think this is very cool from the size and the fact that it represents the small homes, when they built them that's all they could afford. Some might say is this really a landmark, but I think when you look at the history and the size it makes sense to make it a landmark and I don't have any problems with short-term rentals. It may grow into a problem; I don't think it is now downtown. In my mind it does qualify as a landmark.

Chair Arial – Are we ready to make a decision on this?

Bryan Pack – I think you need to make some findings that correspond with the ordinance for landmark status.

MOTION: Rick Atkin made a motion to recommend approval of the landmark designation, the thing that I find the most interesting is the granary part of this, I think we are losing those, and we need to protect those even if it is enclosed in the house. The significance of the historic feature is the granary and the size of the structure. None of the changes over time have changed that.

SECOND: Bob Nicholson and I would add from Kirk Huffanger's letter that it is a vernacular cottage from that period.

AYES: (4)

Bette Arial, Chair

Bob Nicholson, Member

Rick Atkin, Member

Scott Messel, Member

NAYS: (1)

Allan Carter, Member

Motion Carries

2. EXTERIOR MODIFICATION

Consider a request to modify the exterior aesthetics of a significant historical buildings located at 76 West Tabernacle.

Carol Davidson presented the following:

Carol Davidson – This is for rehabilitation for Green Gate Village. Jeff is here to represent Green Gate Village. The Orson Pratt and the Judd house are national landmarks. The Morris house and Judd's store are both local landmarks. The Orson Pratt needs the most repairs. They do need wood railing, soffit, fascia, the front porch needs repair. The Morris house the trim work and front porch repaired painted. The sign for the Judd's store is very weathered and needs repairs on the south side. The granary, the carriage house, and the Green Hedge manor, they all need paint. The Tolley Cabin needs paint and woodwork. Some of the railings are in very poor condition. (Carol showed slides of what needs repaired)

Jeff Parrack – Initially the ownership just wanted us to paint things, to spruce it up. We got in there and got some bids from some local contractors and a lot of them said it needs fixed properly. A lot of the trim is water damaged, I don't think you need to replace everything, but sections of it. The biggest thing is on the Orson Pratt house the railing is missing pieces. The biggest question we have is can we get something that is premade and then match it? Even if we do all of the bottom the same? Or is it something we are going to have to have custom done to match what is there? Which would obviously increase the cost. Most of it is repainting. We were talking about putting up some lights like the City View and string those through. But it is pretty expensive to get the electric there so we may just string them on the front of the homes. We are painting all the buildings, most are white, we have a kind of purple one that we will try to match. We want to get it spruced up and cleaned up. We have had a couple of falls going into the Alfredo's because of the loose tongue and groove. And I think the Morris house also needs some patio work.

Bob Nicholson – Kudos for the group thinking of these improvements. This really is the jewel of downtown and always has been forever. You have two different standards that you have to meet. The national registry has a little higher criteria. Those railings, I think Don Hartley is still the State Historic Preservation Architect. I think if you get Don, there are some products that match the original closely and if he's good with that I would be good with that, but I hesitate to make a recommendation without that, especially on the Pratt house.

Jeff Parrack – Is there a contact, would you have that information?

Carol Davidson – I can get that to you.

Discussion continued on what would be required with the state landmark status

Chair Bette Arial – It is a treasure; it has been underutilized. Judd's store in particular needs care. People line up around the corner in the winter time to have a bowl of soup and a breadstick. It's a very historic place. When it was purchased I was hoping there would be repairs. Judd's looks horrible.

Carol Davidson – As far as the coloring on the signs, I'm not sure that they are the original colors. Maybe some of you know.

Bob Nicholson – The colors were really subdued.

Rick Atkin – On the Judd store there is a lot of adobe brick, that is a hard thing to repair.

Discussion on adobe and repair.

Chair Bette Arial – I would like to recommend that you do a little more research, I think you see the support you have here. If you would check on the colors and all that.

Scott Messel – Yes and I agree with that. I think the string lights would be appropriate.

MOTION: Scott Messel made a motion to table this item to provide the applicant more time to contact the state and get more information about the detail of restoration that will be required.

SECOND: Allan Carter

AYES: (5)

Bette Arial, Chair

Bob Nicholson, Member

Rick Atkin, Member

Scott Messel, Member

Allan Carter, Member

NAYS: (0)

None

Motion Carries

Carol Davidson – I just wanted to let you know that we did receive a CLG grant to update our survey.

3. **MINUTES**

Consider approval of the June 16, 2021, and the July 21, 2021, meeting minutes.

MOTION: Scott Messel made a motion to approve the minutes as written.

SECOND: Rick Atkin

AYES: (5)

Bette Arial, Chair

Bob Nicholson, Member

Rick Atkin, Member

Scott Messel, Member

Allan Carter, Member

NAYS: (0)

None

Motion Carries

4. **ADJOURN**

MOTION: Bob Nicholson made a motion to adjourn

SECOND:

AYES: (5)

Bette Arial, Chair

Bob Nicholson, Member

Rick Atkin, Member

Scott Messel, Member

Allan Carter, Member

NAYS: (0)

None

Motion Carries