

**IVINS CITY
PLANNING COMMISSION
MINUTES
October 15, 2019
435-628-0606**

1) WELCOME AND CALL TO ORDER

CHAIRMAN AND COMMISSIONERS: The meeting was called to order at 5:30 p.m. All present included Chairman Bryan Pack, Commissioner Doug Clifford, Commissioner Lance Anderson, Commissioner Jeff Loris, and Commissioner Bob Morris.

Staff Attending: Dale Coulam-City Manager/Attorney, Mike Rodriguez-Building and Zoning Administrator and Sharon Allen-Deputy City Recorder.

Audience Attending: Dave and Donna Burrill, Dan and Jan Brown, Chris Haddad, Larry and Valerie Cazier, Larry Myers, Diane Chavez, Ron and Annette Densley, Stuart and Tricia Sochrin, Bob Nickerson, Ward Dawson, Gwenn Davies, Dan Coberly, Sue Gordhammer, Lynne Mackechnie, Martha Burbidge, Gary Burbidge, Randall Johnson, Lynne Johnson, Michael and Sharon Barton, Shelley Moeller, Kathy Herrick, Randy Luffberry, Julie Dean, Dean and Sharon Aspenberg, Dave Davies, Mike Guisinger, Renel Jones, Creed Jones, Bill Wentworth, Mike Nicholson, Karen Nicholson, Martin Himmelstein, Mark and Mickey Bishop, Jonathan Upchurch, George Stoddard, Sharon Gillespie, Mark Walter, David Crimin, Regina Roper, Marilee Neilsen, Claudette Larsen, Roger and Kathy Roos, Sam Patel, Terry Marten, Jenny Johnson, Brandon Ogden, Dan McCullough, Rebecca Isakson, Dan Krupicka, CJ Coharcheck as well as others that did not sign in.

A. [Acknowledgement of Quorum](#)

B. **Flag Salute--Commissioner Bob Morris**

C. **Invocation--Commissioner Bob Morris**

D. [Disclosures](#)

Commissioner Lance Anderson stated he has two items on the agenda; Items 4C and 4D, and Items 4E and 4F. **Commissioner Jeff Loris** stated it is not a conflict, but he wanted to disclose that Items 4A and 4B Canyon Crossing work was done by the company that he works for. No other conflicts.

2) REPORTS AND PRESENTATIONS --None

3) BUSINESS LICENSES -None

4) PUBLIC HEARING AND ACTION ITEMS—

A. [Public Hearing regarding a proposed Class V Conditional Use Permit for Canyon Crossing, located at approximately the corner of Snow Canyon Parkway and Snow Canyon Drive. RAD Properties, LLC-Owner. Sam Patel/Dixie Property Management, LLC-Applicant.](#)

Mike Rodriguez stated that this is a proposed commercial development on 2.5 acre site located on the northeast corner of Snow Canyon Drive and Snow Canyon Parkway. The property is zoned Resort Commercial. It consists of four multi-tenant retail buildings that include a convenience store with gas station and canopy with four islands. There are three restaurant uses shown: one adjacent to the convenience store, one has a drive-through lane around it and a restaurant in the third building with a drive-through lane around it. Additional retail space is

1 intended to be tenant space that can be leased out to a variety of different type of retail uses. The
2 table of uses in our zoning code allows automotive self-service stations with a Class V
3 Conditional Use Permit in the Resort Commercial zoning district. An application for a Class V
4 Conditional Use Permit requires a recommendation from the Planning Commission before going
5 to City Council for final decision. Under both State law and City Code, conditional uses are
6 administrative actions. The TRC has reviewed the proposed commercial development and met
7 with the applicant and their design team a number of times to discuss a variety of different uses
8 they are proposing as well as reasonable conditions to be imposed on the project. They
9 considered all the applicable standards and recommended numerous reasonable conditions be
10 imposed to mitigate any anticipated detrimental effects of the proposed project after considering
11 the standards set forth in our code. There are a number of exhibits here to view. The applicant
12 and design team are present to answer any questions if necessary. **Chairman Bryan Pack** stated
13 that this is a Class V Conditional Use Permit so our role is we are looking at the use that is
14 permitted with reasonable conditions to mitigate negative impacts. **Mike Rodriguez** stated it is
15 allowed in that resort commercial zoning district so we are looking at any adverse
16 conditions. **Dale Coulam** stated he would not use the word permitted; rather it is allowed as a
17 Class V Conditional Use Permit. We have a set of standards in our zoning ordinance and the
18 TRC has gone through those and they are an exhibit to this agenda. TRC has recommended a
19 couple dozen conditions they would propose and you may alter or add to those. On Land Use and
20 Zoning Amendments, staff does not recommend because those are legislative decisions. This,
21 under both State Law and City Code, is an administrative decision. **Chairman Bryan**
22 **Pack** opened up the Public Hearing. Ron Densley stated this property has been in their family for
23 over 30 years. The history of this property included a portion being donated as right of way for
24 the Parkway and a sewer line going through the property to serve Red Mountain Spa. A portion
25 of the property was also donated for the bike path and when Tuacahn was being constructed, the
26 property was used as a staging area. This project will be a great tax base and create jobs. Taxes
27 are what makes things in Ivins nice. There are many benefits from that through this project. They
28 have done an awesome job in designing this and have met all requirements of the TRC and taken
29 all the consideration of the neighbors and make this friendly and compatible to the area. Randy
30 Luffberry lives on Docena and stated he is impressed with the design, but has a couple things to
31 consider. The density number of shops seems heavy. He is concerned about that primarily for
32 traffic and volume. When Tuacahn has school and shows, and special events like Iron Man. The
33 more dense it is, the more impact it will have during those times especially. He would like them
34 to consider cancelling out the gas station. We have one already in town. We don't need two. It is
35 a traffic draw and accidents are likely to happen. Living right at the roundabout, we hear near
36 misses almost every day. When you up the traffic volume there are more chances for that to
37 happen. He is also concerned about pedestrian danger. It is tough now as it is to cross the street.
38 He would like to see a traffic study before this hits Council. There may need to be a pedestrian-
39 controlled lighting system there so they can pass without danger. He is impressed with what he
40 sees, just concerned about the future impacts. Dan Brown stated that it looks good, but a gas
41 station makes no sense. Where are the employees parking? It appears to be tight parking. Do a
42 traffic analysis. Snow Canyon had 450k visitors last year. Tuacahn has hundreds of kids going
43 there. Now there are the Terraces at Tuacahn and Sentierre all going down one road. The gas
44 station should go. Johnathan Upchurch stated that he is a traffic engineer by profession. He
45 believes the access and egress to Snow Canyon Drive should be widened to 36 ft wide to allow
46 the driveway to be marked for one lane inbound and two lanes outbound so that no one will be

1 blocking. He suggests that the driveways aprons be flared aprons to meet the street. Building #3
2 shows no rear access for deliveries. The drive-through he was not aware of when he reviewed the
3 site plan. The turning radius is extremely tight. They are barely adequate for a passenger car. He
4 cannot tell from the footprint how large the canopy is. The two dumpster locations requires the
5 waste collection company's driver to back up 180 ft and it includes a curve. He suggests the
6 traffic study that was recommended by TRC be done prior to City Council. Dan Coberly stated
7 he lives on Painted Hills Drive and he has concern about how to control the exit fronting right
8 into Tuacahn and making a left-hand turn there where there is also a crossing there. He does not
9 see a plan for mitigating the factors there. He found a study online regarding pedestrian and
10 bicyclist roundabout issues. A copy of the study can be requested at the Ivins City office. It deals
11 with site issues that come off of roundabouts with regards to traffic. Stuart Sochrin stated if this
12 project is built it will unleash a headache and it should not be built. Not smart growth. Mike
13 Nicholson stated that Rosenberg is a highly regarded engineer. This is not a wily-nily design and
14 they have met all the criteria needed. This will be better than a lot of alternatives like a tire store
15 or mechanic shop. Traffic is a generic complaint. This will not increase the seating at Tuacahn
16 building this. It will service the local community. Sue Gordhammer stated that she wants to
17 stress how this design on paper aesthetically looks very pleasing. It is part of the system that is
18 our City and part of the community. We need to look at it with traffic and the cyclists and the
19 pedestrians. Gas stations require digging underground tanks. There is an aquifer and wells up in
20 Snow Canyon that runs to Padre Canyon so we need to be concerned about leaks. She is not
21 against the development but she is against a gas station. It will generate pollution. At a restaurant
22 people come, sit, stay and eat; and a gas station is all about turn-around. Gas stations also lower
23 property values. Sharon Gillespie stated she lives at Ridgecrest Circle. When growth is unbridled
24 and not managed it becomes unbalanced. I understand and respect that we need a tax base. We
25 have reached an imbalance with this having a gas station included. She would like to point out
26 the number of store fronts in the area that are empty and have been for some time. Will we
27 control the types of businesses that come and go in these stores? Noise is a factor for the
28 surrounding area with dumpsters being emptied. Brandon Ogden stated he lives on Praya Drive
29 and that he is hearing people talk about the dangers of growth but he comes from central
30 California that was under basically a no-growth ordinance, and that causes an equal number of
31 problems. Private property rights are really important. If you are compliant and do what the
32 ordinances say the public opinion should have very limited value. It is highly variable. There is
33 a methodology to ordinances and how things are built and those processes. Just because people
34 do not like something, does not mean it is not a valid thing to do. Chris Haddad stated she is a
35 Shadow Canyon resident and a retired police officer after 28 years. She then became a US
36 Deputy Marshall. \She stated that convenience stores and gas stations staying open until
37 midnight here in this area will result in panhandlers and young teenagers. She is sure that the
38 convenience store will be selling cigarettes, vape pipes, etc. It attracts that type of hanging out.
39 Stores and restaurants being proposed are okay. The other concern is cyclists going in and out of
40 Snow Canyon and dealing with the roundabout and the in and out traffic. CJ Coharcheck stated
41 she lives on Puerto and the number of parking spaces is roughly 7 or 8 per business. The types of
42 stores have no place for overflow for employees to parks and be out of the way for customers. If
43 they take out the gas pumps and put in more parking we would all be happy. Terry Marten stated
44 that lives on Shivano. He can't believe we are talking about a site that enters Tuacahn and enters
45 the City of Ivins along Snow Canyon Parkway and thinking that the best thing on that site is a
46 service station and a convenience store. Fifteen years ago a group of planners and citizens sat

1 down and started driving this City in a direction that would make it a destination-oriented city for
2 the kinds of things that are unfound anywhere else in Southern Utah. Tuacahn Amphitheater and
3 Snow Canyon is an amazing place and with a little careful planning we could show the world
4 how communities could be developed. Lately power and greed has this City's soul lost to the
5 dollar. He envisions restaurants and facilities to serve the community. Go get gas somewhere
6 else. We have that already in Ivins and one at the reservation just down the road. This site needs
7 to be unique and spectacular and this is not that direction at all. We need to design and create and
8 plan an exceptional town. A Conditional Use Permit is created to drive the direction of the
9 design and construction in a way that will satisfy the community now and in the future. He
10 would hate to see what we have here slip away. Mark Walter stated he lives at Red Rock Circle
11 and a few years ago Citadel and Eagle Rock came to the roundabout. We had a packed house in
12 opposition back then, and how many live there and enjoy that area now? Same issue with the
13 LDS Church. There was much opposition and people were worried about views. We have had
14 other projects where the concern was lighting, color etc. What use makes sense for this City is
15 this City's business. When you come through this process, you have a proposal before you and an
16 opportunity to make it mirror what you want to see in this community. These guys are doing
17 everything in their power to make it a pleasing asset to the community. The Church is very rare.
18 There is nothing like it here. It was specially done for Ivins City and it was this staff and board
19 that had the vision to think outside the box and make it happen for the community. Rocky Vista
20 University chose this location over St George. They have all been a great asset to the community.
21 Something will happen to this property. It has been on the market for awhile but now here is the
22 plan and they are trying to accommodate what the community wants. It will be the nicest place
23 around. Be a part of the solution, don't just shoot it down. Sharon Barton stated that we do not
24 want to become another Sunset Boulevard. We are a view corridor and that does not fit in. Dan
25 McCullough stated he lives at 285 Painted Hills Drive and driving up Tuacahn is as amazing as
26 Zion. Yosemite had a gas station on the floor of the valley and it was terribly ugly and they
27 finally tore it out. His concern is traffic and lights on and cars until midnight. Rebecca Isakson
28 stated she lives on Wisteria Way and is concerned about the developer following our night sky
29 compliance. The property was for sale and believe that people have a right to do what they want
30 with their land, but we as taxpayers should have a fund that we can buy some of these properties
31 from these farmers and keep some open space and beautiful sight corridors and tax money
32 should be used to buy some of this land. Put a cow on it and get a tax break. On Highway 91
33 every time she passes the tall condos, that view is gone. Michael Barton stated that the Densley
34 family is owed a lot of respect and gratitude by this community, but this is in the entrance to
35 Snow Canyon and Tuacahn and common sense should be applied here. Is this good for the
36 community long term? Hearing no further comments, **Chairman Bryan Pack** closed the Public
37 Hearing.

B. Discuss and consider recommendation of a proposed Class V Conditional Use Permit for Canyon Crossing, located at approximately the corner of Snow Canyon Parkway and Snow Canyon Drive. RAD Properties, LLC-Owner. Sam Patel/Dixie Property Management, LLC-Applicant.

38 **Chairman Bryan Pack** stated a lot of concerns were addressed in the proposed conditions by
39 TRC. One condition #12 states not that a parking study needs to be done, but just that there will
40 not be any outside seating unless a parking study shows that there is sufficient parking. Item #25
41 shows a reference to a trip study. He thinks it would be helpful to know that data impacts traffic
42 and parking and that it should be done. Do we have any guidance to refer to before those studies

1 are done? **Mike Rodriguez** stated that Condition #12 did not have any outdoor seating being
2 proposed for any of the three restaurants, but in the future that could be a possibility so they
3 would need to complete a parking study at that time to consider if that would be allowed. We
4 have provisions in our zoning code that calculates the number of parking spaces that are required
5 onsite an off-street. Based on the uses and the sizes of the buildings, as proposed, we determined
6 the appropriate number of parking spaces for the proposed uses as they are being submitted in
7 this application. They are in conformance with the number required in our zoning ordinance. Our
8 2005 code is based on sizes of building and size of that particular use. For example, one parking
9 space per 400 sq ft of gross building area. Those get calculated out and we take that up to the
10 next highest number. We maxed out and have the highest number of spaces per our code
11 requirements for the types of uses they are proposing on this site. They have met the minimum
12 parking spaces that are required for the proposed uses. On the study, they have given an initial
13 traffic count for the proposed uses to our City Engineer. That is a Class I Traffic Study that their
14 engineer has to complete and submit to us and reviewed before we determine the traffic
15 count. **Dale Coulam** stated the City is taking the planning that was done years ago and applying
16 it to this application. Planning from years ago stated that this piece of property was zoned Resort
17 Commercial. It does not say only unique and spectacular uses. A Class V Conditional Use Permit
18 has in it, an automotive self service station in the Resort Commercial zone. If we were talking
19 about zoning or changing the table of uses comments objecting to the gas station would be an
20 appropriate topic However, we are under a legal duty to apply the ordinances as they are written
21 to this application. We have to follow the laws just like the applicant has to follow our laws.
22 Parking has an ordinance in place and it meets that criteria per our zoning administrator. The
23 traffic count was required by the Technical Review Committee and the City Engineer required a
24 traffic study. The Planning Commission can state that they want to see that traffic study before
25 recommending to Council to make a final decision because of the safety concerns raised here.
26 **Commissioner Doug Clifford** stated valid points have been made and to some extent decisions
27 were already made by the current zoning laws and now we decide if this application fits. There
28 were things that were not around when those zoning laws were created. That roundabout for
29 bikers is a real issue and the impact of the roundabout could be significant. Others that I am
30 thinking of in this area are all on lighted intersections. **Chairman Bryan Pack** stated that the
31 impact may be different because of the roundabout. **Commissioner Doug Clifford** stated it
32 needs to be talked about and deal with it or it will be highest accident point in the
33 city. **Commissioner Jeff Loris** stated that on the traffic study, there will be a person sitting in a
34 lawn chair there for weeks counting how many people come through there and then they estimate
35 by taking the busiest and slowest time. Traffic going through the roundabout will not be
36 estimated, only the site itself. The City of Ivins has to do an engineered study specifically for the
37 roundabout to take care of that. It won't be Ron Densley because he is doing his own site. **Dale**
38 **Coulam** stated if we retain an engineer for a traffic study, we may go to the applicant for that
39 cost. If we need that data in order to make a reasonable decision then it could be necessary as
40 part of their application. **Commissioner Jeff Loris** inquired if we could see information
41 regarding public safety and compare it to Lightfoots? **Dale Coulam** stated he would request that
42 information. **Chairman Bryan Pack** stated he doesn't see public safety as a concern. We have
43 had very few issues with Lightfoot's. **Commissioner Lance Anderson** inquired how many
44 pumps? **Dale Coulam** stated it originally had five islands with one double-sided pump on each
45 island. The canopy now has four islands so a total of eight pumps. The canopy can be no more
46 than 2500 sq ft per our table of uses and 3000 sq ft for the convenience store. **Mike**

1 **Rodriguez** stated they also agreed to reduce the overall mass of the canopy so it was a more
2 subtle structure with no canopy signage. **Chairman Bryan Pack** stated that our four adverse
3 impacts are traffic safety, crime, lighting and viewshed. **Dale Coulam** stated that along Snow
4 Canyon Parkway there is an additional requirement of a 15 degree view angle and buildings
5 cannot protrude through that view angle. Their exhibit shows that they are under that view angle
6 and the canopy does not impact it. They comply with that requirement as well. They submitted
7 drawings to show that they are under that requirement. **Commissioner Lance**
8 **Anderson** inquired on the convenience store, is there an access out the back of it? **Dale**
9 **Coulam** stated there may be an emergency door. We have required that all the utilities be on the
10 north side of the building and it be landscaped **Mike Rodriguez** stated that proposed condition
11 #6 should not have any utilities meters or other equipment on the back side and they will be on
12 the north side of the building. They will also be screened with landscaping. **Commissioner**
13 **Lance Anderson** stated everyone seems to have a problem with the gas station. Could we as a
14 Planning Commission put any conditions on here against that? **Dale Coulam** stated that has been
15 taken out of our hands. It is already zoned to allow for that use as a Class V conditional use, but
16 we can mitigate the adverse impacts of a gas station in that location by the list of conditions. We
17 would have to see those studies. It is reasonable to say that before we make our
18 recommendations that we want to see factual data on traffic as a safety issue. **Commissioner**
19 **Lance Anderson** stated when the grocery store went in, they had to figure out a way to mitigate
20 the sound of the commercial air conditioners. **Dale Coulam** stated the conditions now require
21 they be screened with parapets but you can get more specific. **Chairman Bryan Pack** inquired
22 about the turning radius on drive-throughs and if it is appropriate? **Mike Rodriguez** stated that
23 this was discussed at TRC and the radius on the drive-through were going to have to be large
24 enough to accommodate larger vehicles. **Commissioner Lance Anderson** stated Jonathan
25 Upchurch brought up the exit on the west side. **Mike Rodriguez** stated the traffic study needs to
26 be done. We do not know how soon that will be completed. **Commissioner Lance**
27 **Anderson** stated they have thought about viewshed and drainage, but lighting is still a
28 concern. **Chairman Bryan Pack** stated we have the dark sky initiative. **Dale Coulam** stated that
29 the proposal for the dark sky initiative has not yet been adopted by the City, but our current
30 outdoor lighting covers a lot of those issues. TRC listed lighting as a condition and what they
31 have done on past projects was purchased night sky compliant lighting and they agreed to do
32 that. It needs to comply with our ordinance. He doesn't know that we can go beyond
33 that. **Commissioner Jeff Loris** stated that the law is the law. If you don't want anyone to build
34 there, purchase it. **Chairman Bryan Pack** inquired if we see any negative impacts that is not
35 covered by our ordinances, we can impose those to help mitigate that. **Dale Coulam** stated if
36 there is a safety issue, not just purely an aesthetic issue. It must cause an adverse impact or
37 danger. **Chairman Bryan Pack** stated that they have worked on six items on their list. Traffic
38 safety, crime...**Commissioner Bob Morris** stated those of which will be resolved by a
39 study. **Commissioner Doug Clifford** stated that the roundabout is a unique situation. That traffic
40 study needs to take those in to account. **Commissioner Bob Morris** stated it won't generate
41 traffic it will disrupt traffic. **Chairman Bryan Pack** stated that he thinks it will. Let us get a list
42 of adverse impacts and get the traffic study and consider these and come up with a
43 recommendation. **Commissioner Lance Anderson** stated he would like to see a schematic of the
44 canopy. **Chairman Bryan Pack** stated so the list is traffic safety, crime, lighting, viewshed,
45 noise, larger vehicles. **Commissioner Lance Anderson** inquired what about
46 environmental? **Mike Rodriguez** stated that EPA requires that and it will comply with those

1 regulations. **Chairman Bryan Pack** stated also dumpster location and ability to back up and the
2 size of west entrance covered in the traffic study.

3 **MOTION: Commissioner Doug Clifford moved to continue consider recommendation of a**
4 **proposed Class V Conditional Use Permit for Canyon Crossing, located at approximately**
5 **the corner of Snow Canyon Parkway and Snow Canyon Drive. RAD Properties, LLC-**
6 **Owner. Sam Patel/Dixie Property Management, LLC-Applicant.**

7 **SECOND: Commissioner Jeff Loris**

8 **VOTE: The motion carried.**

Chairman Bryan Pack	AYE
Commissioner Doug Clifford	AYE
Commissioner Lance Anderson	AYE
Commissioner Jeff Loris	AYE
Commissioner Bob Morris	AYE

9 **C. Public Hearing regarding a proposed Amendment to the Preliminary Plan for Taviawk**
10 **Subdivision, Phases XI and XII. Located at approximately 800 North and 600 West.**
11 **Kayenta Development Inc.—Owner. Lance Anderson—Applicant.**

12 **Commissioner Lance Anderson** recused himself. **Mike Rodriguez** stated that this is an
13 amended Preliminary Plan for phases XI and XII and includes an extension of Paiute Drive, and
14 it shows an easement for the sewer line and reduces the size of the cul-de-sac. TRC has reviewed
15 this and it is compliance with city ordinances. **Chairman Bryan Pack** opened the Public
16 Hearing. Hearing no comments, **Chairman Bryan Pack** closed the Public Hearing.

17 **D. Discuss and consider recommendation of a proposed Amendment to the Preliminary**
18 **Plan for Taviawk Subdivision, Phases XI and XII. Located at approximately 800 North**
19 **and 600 West. Kayenta Development Inc.—Owner. Lance Anderson—Applicant.**

20 **Commissioner Doug Clifford** inquired if this was done as a safety issue or zoning? **Lance**
21 **Anderson** stated that these lots were part of 600 West and we did not know how that road would
22 be completed, so we amended it to solve both our problems. We shortened the cul-de-sacs to
23 lessen the radius of the cul-de-sac. It was a lot of asphalt for no reason. The City is working on
24 drainage down to the wash. It meets the requirements of city roads.

19 **MOTION: Commissioner Doug Clifford moved to approve recommendation of a proposed**
20 **Amendment to the Preliminary Plan for Taviawk Subdivision, Phases XI and XII. Located**
21 **at approximately 800 North and 600 West. Kayenta Development Inc.—Owner. Lance**
22 **Anderson—Applicant.**

23 **SECOND: Commissioner Bob Morris**

24 **VOTE: The motion carried.**

Chairman Bryan Pack	AYE
Commissioner Doug Clifford	AYE
Commissioner Jeff Loris	AYE
Commissioner Bob Morris	AYE
Commissioner Lance Anderson	RECUSE

25 **E. Public Hearing regarding a proposed Amendment to the General Plan, Transportation**
26 **Master Plan, and Trails Master Plan.**

27 **Commissioner Lance Anderson** stated awhile back there was a concept plan for this area and
28 there was a group of individuals that wanted to keep these private streets. Kayenta Parkway is a
public street so the trail is owned and maintained by the HOA and it will go back to the reservoir.
One other component to this is that the rural cross-section shows it is on the east side of Taviawk

1 but we are moving it to the west side of Taviawk. We are looking at where all that might flow, so
2 we moved it. **Chairman Bryan Pack** opened the Public Hearing. Gwenn Davies stated she lives
3 on Kwavasa and is voicing support to eliminate the trail on Kaleva, Tuweap and Evening Star.
4 She submitted a photograph with a box culvert on Kaleva that is surrounded by a massive rock
5 retaining wall and her concern is if there was a trail there, it is not enough space between the
6 street and the wash. On the upper side is far less space, maybe a foot. There is a real challenge to
7 putting a trail there. Very low foot traffic doesn't warrant putting trail in on three private roads.
8 Dave Davies stated that he has observed the foot traffic along Kaleva and Evening Star and
9 Tuweap. On average, there are eight people or less that use those streets. The reason being that
10 the lots are one acre and a half and maybe two people inside those homes. There are mostly
11 adults out there, so there is not a need for sidewalk. Why spend the taxpayers money on such an
12 expensive project? To get across the wash a bridge would need to go there. It is not needed. Dan
13 Krupicka lives on the east side of Kayenta Parkway. He is not opposed to a trail, but his concern
14 is specifically to his lot because he doesn't think there is an easement there to put the trail in and
15 there are large trees that shields him from Kayenta Parkway. He would like to see widths and
16 more details. There is not much pedestrian traffic to justify the cost. **Commissioner Lance**
17 **Anderson** stated this is the trails master plan and no trail is going in, this is for the future. The
18 right of way is there but Kayenta Parkway would just move over. This is just conceptual. Roger
19 Roos stated he is in support of eliminating the trail on private streets. It would be a huge expense
20 for nothing. They value the quietness. Lynn Mackechnie stated that she has lived on the corner of
21 Kaleva and Tuweap Drive since 2003. She has full view and uses both streets as a walker and
22 cyclist. Walkers are maybe one or two per hour and cyclists use the road regardless of the
23 existence of a pathway. For vehicles, there is very light car traffic and no conflict between these
24 all that she has observed. No complaints between sharing the road. The need is not there and the
25 expense is unnecessary. Sue Gordhammer lives on Kayenta Parkway and is in support of
26 removing the trail but is pleased to hear that this is just the trail plan. We would lose trees all
27 along the Parkway and she would hope residents would have an opportunity to have input before
28 any construction. Sharon Aspenberger stated she lives on the end of Kwavasa and it looks like a
29 trail west of Kaleva and all the way around the reservoir. Her preference would be to leave it
30 around the reservoir and not go into Kaleva. Gary Burbidge stated he lives on Kaleva and we had
31 several meetings with the HOA over the box culvert. It was expensive to put it over that very
32 large wash, so they kept the width to a bare minimum and rock banks on both sides that are
33 basically vertical. Last summer we heard about safety concerns on the north side because it was
34 so vertical and a 2 ft shoulder. HOA took it to heart and put boulders so that vehicles don't
35 potentially leave the asphalt and drop off there. The only way to do it safely would be to put a
36 dedicated span across that wash to accommodate cyclists and pedestrians and it would be very
37 expensive but would eliminate the safety issue that the HOA is concerned with. Martha
38 Burbidge stated she lives on Kaleva and she likes that it is so important to the Kayenta
39 community to get as much traffic to the art village as we can. She likes the proposal and would
40 like to continue that focus. Hearing no further comments, **Chairman Bryan Pack** closed the
41 Public Hearing.

F. Discuss and consider recommendation of a proposed Amendment to the General Plan, Transportation Master Plan, and Trails Master Plan.

42 **Commissioner Doug Clifford** inquired if there was a negative in having it in the trails plan if no
43 one is excited about having it built? **Dale Coulam** stated it was a public right of way for a trail
44 on a private street. He thinks what Lance Anderson is suggesting is good planning. **Chairman**

1 **Bryan Pack** inquired if it would not be better to just leave the trail off the map completely,
2 rather than move it? **Commissioner Lance Anderson** stated it goes all the way down to Hwy
3 91. **Dale Coulam** stated we are looking for connecting trails and circulation for the
4 City. **Chairman Bryan Pack** stated he sees a connection already but he is not opposed either
5 way. **Commissioner Jeff Loris** stated we have one through Center Street and Tuachan Drive
6 and this is just a leg off that trail system. It is a good idea to have it master-planned. **Chairman**
7 **Bryan Pack** stated at that time they choose to do it is it a private expense to homeowners? It
8 would be the City doing it but the homeowners would have to be in favor of it and require
9 acquisition of right of ways. **Commissioner Lance Anderson** stated it would take a lot of effort
10 to do it. We have started that process in filling in where we can fill in as needed. If this part got
11 developed, it would have to be part of the Capital Facilities Plan and another section where
12 maybe a homeowner wants trail in front of his house.

13 **MOTION: Commissioner Bob Morris moved to approve recommendation of a proposed**
14 **Amendment to the General Plan, Transportation Master Plan, and Trails Master Plan.**

15 **SECOND: Commissioner Jeff Loris**

16 **VOTE: The motion carried.**

Chairman Bryan Pack	AYE
Commissioner Doug Clifford	AYE
Commissioner Jeff Loris	AYE
Commissioner Bob Morris	AYE
Commissioner Lance Anderson	RECUSE

G. **Public Hearing regarding 2019 update to the Ivins City Moderate Income Housing Plan.**

17 **Mike Rodriguez** stated that the task force has been meeting regularly regarding this. State law
18 needs this updated by December 1st so we have the date updated and Lane Mecham has taken on
19 the task of getting this data all updated. The task force had a minimum of 3 strategies. It can be
20 modified and amended in the future, but it needs to move to City Council. **Chairman Bryan**
21 **Pack** opened the Public Hearing. Sharon Barton stated that she read the report and she wondered
22 about goals objectives and strategy. Number one states rezoned for densities necessary to ensure
23 production of moderate income housing. As a resident, when she moved here she looked at the
24 current land use and zoning plan but if we allow strategic rezoning within the City, who would
25 do that and where would it be? Strategy number 2 and 3 makes sense but if strategic rezoning
26 falls into the wrong hands do residents have any say? Randy Johnson stated the proposal is
27 meeting the State's standards on a minimal level. His concern is that in a desert environment high
28 density is huge. He asked the City Council to speak to Ron Thompson as it relates to water, and
29 they opted not to do that and he retires the end of December. The tighter you make it the
30 demands are higher. Future properties should have zero landscaping as a condition of
31 development. CJ Coharcheck wondered why students were involved in the assessment. They
32 have housing and they will move to a job waiting for them. They will make more money
33 elsewhere after they graduate. Their income numbers brought everything down. Dan Brown
34 stated the townhomes that are all connected look like barracks with garages. Why don't we build
35 things for people to have room to move around? We need a better idea. Hearing no further
36 comments, **Chairman Bryan Pack** closed the Public Hearing.

H. **Discuss and consider recommendation regarding 2019 update to the Ivins City Moderate Income Housing Plan.**

1 **Commissioner Bryan Pack** stated that this represents a minimum requirement to comply. It has
2 been required by the state statute and we were given 22 items to pick from and we picked 3
3 because it is due December 1st and they were the low hanging fruit. There are no easy solutions
4 to this problem when we can see what is happening to the cost of housing when it is so desirable
5 to live here. We look at where our kids will live when they get that chance and at this point, it
6 would possibly not be in Ivins. Water is a definite concern. This amendment is not intended to
7 address all those concerns and those discussions still needs to be done. **Commissioner Jeff**
8 **Loris** stated that just a month or so ago, Mayor Hart received an award for Ivins being the lowest
9 usage in the state for water. **Chairman Bryan Pack** stated that he knows Ron Thompson has
10 been here before. **Commissioner Lance Anderson** stated that we need to look at our resources
11 as a whole. A fireman wants you to get rid of plants, but then you have an erosion problem.
12 Conserve water and save on trees, but the trees help cool the area and help reduce your power
13 bill. Student numbers gave a demographic to hit our benchmarks to get a lower threshold. **Mike**
14 **Rodriguez** stated they are still residents of the City. It may be temporary, but they live
15 here. **Chairman Bryan Pack** stated that he is in favor of sending this to City Council to get it
16 submitted to the State so that they don't come down and regulate us harder. **Commissioner Doug**
17 **Clifford** stated that rezoning is done by Public Hearings, this body and the City Council.
18 Coming to these meetings get your voice heard. **Chairman Bryan Pack** stated that is developer-
19 driven though. Developers develop our City. Commissioner Doug Clifford stated strategic
20 rezoning meant that we will try to find places to do this without disrupting the rest of our
21 residents and meet the states minimum requirements. There is not much meat on the bones of
22 this report. **Commissioner Lance Anderson** stated that allowing the rental of accessory
23 buildings changes what people thought when they moved here.
24 **MOTION: Commissioner Lance Anderson moved to approve recommendation regarding**
25 **2019 update to the Ivins City Moderate Income Housing Plan.**
26 **SECOND: Commissioner Doug Clifford**
27 **VOTE: The motion carried.**

Chairman Bryan Pack	AYE
Commissioner Doug Clifford	AYE
Commissioner Lance Anderson	AYE
Commissioner Jeff Loris	AYE
Commissioner Bob Morris	AYE

5) DISCUSSION AND POTENTIAL ACTION ITEMS—

A. [Discuss and consider recommendation of amending Density Allowances for Multi-Family Development.](#)

28 **MOTION: Chairman Bryan Pack moved to continue consider recommendation of**
29 **amending Density Allowances for Multi-Family Development.**

30 **SECOND: Commissioner Lance Anderson**

31 **VOTE: The motion carried.**

Chairman Bryan Pack	AYE
Commissioner Doug Clifford	AYE
Commissioner Lance Anderson	AYE
Commissioner Jeff Loris	AYE
Commissioner Bob Morris	AYE

B. [Discuss and consider approval of date change or cancellation of November 5th 2019 Planning Commission Meeting.](#)

MOTION: Commissioner Lance Anderson moved to approve date change or cancellation of November 5th 2019 Planning Commission Meeting to October 29th.

SECOND: Commissioner Doug Clifford

VOTE: The motion carried.

Chairman Bryan Pack	AYE
Commissioner Doug Clifford	AYE
Commissioner Lance Anderson	AYE
Commissioner Jeff Loris	AYE
Commissioner Bob Morris	AYE

C. [Discuss and consider approval of the Ivins City Planning Commission Minutes for October 1st 2019.](#)

MOTION: Commissioner Jeff Loris moved to approve the Ivins City Planning Commission Minutes for October 1st 2019.

SECOND: Commissioner Doug Clifford

VOTE: The motion carried.

Chairman Bryan Pack	AYE
Commissioner Doug Clifford	AYE
Commissioner Lance Anderson	AYE
Commissioner Jeff Loris	AYE
Commissioner Bob Morris	AYE

6) REPORTS

A. Planning Commission

B. Chairman

C. Building and Zoning Administrator, Mike Rodriguez

D. City Attorney, Dale Coulam

E. [Items to be placed on future agendas](#)

Mike Rodriguez stated that Mojave Mesa Preliminary Plan. Canyon Crossing may be coming back to you if the traffic study is completed. **Commissioner Bob Morris** stated that he would like to look into the use of renting casitas and now we have this affordable housing report. **Commissioner Lance Anderson** would like to have a Public Hearing on it and define what we are trying to accomplish.

7) [ADJOURNMENT](#)

MOTION: Commissioner Lance Anderson moved to approve ADJOURNMENT

SECOND: Commissioner Bob Morris

VOTE: The motion carried.

Chairman Bryan Pack	AYE
Commissioner Doug Clifford	AYE
Commissioner Lance Anderson	AYE
Commissioner Jeff Loris	AYE
Commissioner Bob Morris	AYE