



HPC Docket # 19-003

**Certificate of Appropriateness for
Ellen Eccles Theater Façade Renovation
located at 43 South Main Street**

REPORT SUMMARY...

<i>Project Name:</i>	Ellen Eccles Theater Façade Renovation
<i>Owner/Proponent:</i>	Logan City/Cache Valley Center for the Arts, Wendi Hassan
<i>Request:</i>	A Certificate of Appropriateness for a Building Façade Renovation
<i>Current Zoning:</i>	Town Center - Historic District (TC-HD)
<i>Staff Recommendation:</i>	Conditionally Approve
<i>Date of Hearing:</i>	April 15, 2019
<i>Presented By</i>	Aaron Smith, Planner II

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Committee **conditionally approve** HPC Docket # 19-003, Ellen Eccles Theater Façade Renovation, located at 43 South Main Street; TIN #06-030-0033,06-030-0030.

PROJECT

The project request involves several facade changes and renovations, including:

- removal of existing architectural details that are falling off,
- repainting of existing painted brick from a pale grey to a brick red
- add new low maintenance metal trim above lower windows,
- Replace old columns and pilasters with new low maintenance polyurethane columns and pilasters,
- add gold leaf to existing medallions,
- add new granite kick plate and column bases.
- Replace signage

This project impacts both 43 South Main and 37 South Main. The two buildings house the Ellen Eccles Theatre, Cache Center for the Arts, and the Bullen Center. The two buildings, while historically separate, have a shared façade. The entrance to Ellen Eccles Theatre includes a marquee that projects approximately 17' from the building facade. The Two (2) properties have a total area of approximately 0.5 acres.

HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

The Capitol Theatre, at 43 South Main, was built in 1923 after the original Thatcher Opera House burned down in 1912. Historically, the theatre featured opera and vaudeville productions. Later, the live performances shared the stage with film, which soon became the dominant feature at the theater. By the 1980s, the theatre had fallen into disrepair and neglect. A community effort to renovate the theatre and create the adjacent Bullen Center began in the late 1980s. On January 8, 1993, following a \$4.3 million investment, the Capitol Theatre was reopened as the Ellen Eccles Theatre. The current façade was constructed during the renovation.

The Capital Theatre façade prior to the renovation was rather plain, and did not reflect the ornamental details of the interior. Most prominent on the old facade was the marquee and large projecting sign above the marquee.

The two-story commercial building at 37 South Main was built by George Thatcher in 1902. The brick building was built in a commercial style with some Victorian embellishments, and featured a heavy and ornate cornice with heavy bracketing. This building became the Bullen Center in the 1990s.

As part of the renovations in the 90s, the theatre and commercial building façades were combined into the untied façade that is present today. Some elements of the original commercial building have been preserved in the second-floor windows of the new façade. No features of the original theatre façade persist other than the entrance location and inclusion of a marquee. Other elements, though not the originals, reflect styles that were present on the historic façade, such as the ornate cornice. Overall, the new theater façade style was designed to reflect the ornate neo-classical elements of the interior of the theater, and emphasized ornate pilasters, columns, and capitals, cornices, pediment, and other embellishments. The façade was painted white and pale white, likely to emphasize the neo-classical elements.

HISTORICAL SURVEYS

Michael Christensen's 1978 *Survey for Historic Homes for Logan City*, predates the façade renovations of the 1990s and lists the Capitol Theatre (43 S Main) as "Contributory" in the evaluation and the building condition is considered "Good" and "Unaltered". The survey describes the front façade as simple compared to the elaborate classical interior. The commercial building (37 S Main) is listed as "Significant" and the building condition is considered "Good" and "Unaltered".

The 1999 and 2011 Reconnaissance Level Survey were completed after the renovations in the 1990s. The buildings, with a combined façade, are given an "A" evaluation, meaning the building is considered "Eligible/Significant" to the historic district.

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

The Land Development Code (LDC) §17.27.070 requires a Certificate of Appropriateness to be obtained for any exterior construction requiring a building permit.

Historic District Design Standards

The Historic District Design Standards (HDDS) states the following about rehabilitation:

9.8 MATERIALS & FINISHES STANDARDS

Primary historic building materials should be preserved and regularly maintained in place and should not be covered. Replacements should be limited to only materials that are damaged beyond repair and should match the original. Synthetic or substitute materials, such as vinyl, are prohibited. Do not paint surfaces that were not originally painted. These materials may have been chosen for their decorative and/or functional qualities and painting them may disguise and abolish the original character and can trap moisture causing extensive damage over time. Retain masonry features such as bonding patterns and mortar joint tooling. Some later covering materials may have achieved historic significance and should be preserved. This is preferred if the original historic material cannot be preserved or would be damaged in the removal process. Avoid harsh, abrasive cleaning such as sandblasting and high-pressure water to remove paint.

STAFF SUMMARY

As the façade was extensively renovated during the 1990s, the proposed project does not affect historic elements of the building. New paint is appropriate, as the brick is already painted. The proposed paint color more closely aligns with the original brick color. The brake metal window trim would replace a non-historic ornate trim, but the proposed metal would match existing trim materials, and examples of metal trim separating first floor windows is prevalent along Main Street. The replacement of the columns and pilasters with polyurethane is not permitted in the historic district as

synthetic materials are prohibited. The current columns and pilasters are a poly-blend and plaster-blend material. The columns at the front of the marquee include metal embellishments.

PUBLIC NOTICE

Public Notice letters were sent to adjacent property owners with a 300-foot radius of the property and legal notice was published in the Herald Journal on 3/25/19.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

No public comment has been received for the project.

RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

This project is subject to the proponent or property owner agreeing to comply with the following conditions as written, or as may be amended by the Historic Preservation Committee.

1. Any representations by the proponent at the Historic Preservation Committee hearing that is approved shall be incorporated into the final action as conditions of approval and recorded on the Certificate of Appropriateness.
2. Replacement for columns and pilasters shall not be of a synthetic material.
3. Replacement of architectural detailing on the façade or marquee shall not be of a synthetic material.
4. All new signage shall obtain a sign permit in accordance with the Land Development Code and Center Street Historic District prior to installation.
5. The proponent is responsible to ensure that any construction is appropriately permitted and inspected by the Building Safety Division through timely scheduled inspections.
6. Failure to comply with any conditions of approval shall void the permit and require a new Historic Preservation Committee hearing.

RECOMMENDED FINDINGS FOR APPROVAL

The Historic Preservation Committee bases its decisions on the following findings supported in the administrative record for this project:

1. The project complies with all requirements imposed by Title 17 of the Logan Municipal Code.
2. The project is consistent with the objectives and purpose of the General Plan and Title 17 of the Logan Municipal Code by helping to maintain the Town Center (TC) zone as the central location for the community's historic and cultural resources.
3. The conditioned project will help to improve the contributory status of the building.
4. As conditioned, the project will not negatively impact the surrounding contributing structures inside the district.
5. The project substantially complies with standards outlined in the *Historic District Design Standards* and the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Reconstruction*.

This staff report is an analysis of the application based on adopted city documents, standard city development practices, and available information. The report is to be used to review and consider the merits of the application prior to and during the course of the Historic Preservation Committee meeting. Additional information may be revealed by participants at the Planning Commission meeting which may modify the staff report and become the Certificate of Decision. The Director of Community Development reserves the right to supplement the material in the report with additional information at the Historic Preservation Committee meeting.



APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Apr. 15 meeting

Date Received 3-8-19	Received By	Receipt Number	Zone TC-HD	Application Number HPG 19-003
PROJECT NAME ELLEN ECCLES THEATER FACADE RENOVATION				
PROJECT ADDRESS 43 SOUTH MAIN STREET, LOGAN, UTAH 84321			COUNTY PLAT TAX ID # 06 - 030 - 0033 0030	
AUTHORIZED AGENT (Must be accurate and complete) CACHE VALLEY CENTER FOR THE ARTS, WENDI HASSAN			MAIN PHONE # 435.753.6518	
MAILING ADDRESS 43 SOUTH MAIN STREET		CITY LOGAN	STATE UTAH	ZIP 84321
EMAIL ADDRESS whassan@cachearts.org				
PROPERTY OWNER OF RECORD (Must be listed) LOGAN CITY CORPORATION			MAIN PHONE # 435.716.9000	
MAILING ADDRESS 290 NORTH 100 WEST		CITY LOGAN	STATE UTAH	ZIP 84321
EMAIL ADDRESS holly.daines@loganutah.org				
DESCRIBE THE PROPOSED PROJECT AS IT SHOULD BE PRESENTED (Include as much detail as possible - attach a separate sheet if needed) - REMOVAL OF EXISTING ARCHITECTURAL DETAIL FALLING OFF - REPAINT EXISTING BRICK, NEW COLOR PROPOSED - ADD NEW LOW MAINTENANCE TRIM ABOVE LOWER WINDOWS - REMOVE OLD COLUMN DETAILS, REPLACE WITH NEW LOW MAINTENANCE POLYURITHANE PILASTERS AND COLUMNS. - ADD GOLD LEAF TO EXISTING AND NEW MEDALLIONS. - ADD NEW GRANITE KICK PLATE AND COLUMN BASES. - NO SITE ACTIVITY MAY OCCUR UNTIL AFTER APPROPRIATE COMMITTEE APPROVAL -			Total Lot Size (acres) 0.49	
			Size of Proposed New Building (square feet) NA	
			Number of Proposed New Units/Lots NA	
I certify that the information contained in this application and all supporting plans are correct and accurate. I also certify that I am authorized to sign all further legal documents and permits on behalf of the property owner.			Signature of Property Owner's Authorized Agent  Executive Director, Cache Arts	
I certify that I am the property owner on record of the subject property and that I consent to the submittal of this project. I understand that all further legal documents and permits will be sent to my authorized agent listed above.			Signature of Property Owner 	



MAIN STREET

A1

MAIN STREET PERSPECTIVE

SCALE: NONE



CENTER STREET
ARCHITECTS
170 E. CENTER STREET
LOGAN, UTAH 84321
CENTERSTREETARCH.COM

MELLE DETTENMAIER 453.890.2009
CHRISTIAN WILSON 435.232.8662

TITLE	MAIN STREET PERSPECTIVE
PROJECT	ELLEN ECCLES THEATER FACADE RENOVATION
CLIENT	CACHE VALLEY CENTER FOR THE ARTS
ADDRESS	43 SOUTH MAIN STREET, LOGAN UTAH 84321

REVISIONS		
NO.	DATE	DESCRIPTION

DATE: 03.08.19
JOB NO.
SCALE: 3/16"=1'-0"
DRAWN: JCW
SHEET

A001

ALL DRAWINGS, SPECIFICATIONS, DESIGN AND REVISIONS ARE THE PROPERTY OF CENTER STREET ARCHITECTS. NO PART OF THESE DRAWINGS SHALL BE REPRODUCED OR USED IN ANY MANNER WITHOUT THE WRITTEN CONSENT OF CENTER STREET ARCHITECTS. CONTRACTORS SHALL BE RESPONSIBLE FOR ALL DIMENSIONS AND CONDITIONS SHOWN ON THESE DRAWINGS. COPYRIGHT © 2019 CENTER STREET ARCHITECTS LLC.



CENTER STREET
ARCHITECTS
170 E. CENTER STREET
LOGAN, UTAH 84321
CENTERSTREETARCH.COM

MELLE DETTENMAIER 453.890.2009
CHRISTIAN WILSON 435.232.8662

TITLE	MAIN STREET ELEVATION
PROJECT	ELLEN ECCLES THEATER FACADE RENOVATION
CLIENT	CACHE VALLEY CENTER FOR THE ARTS
ADDRESS	43 SOUTH MAIN STREET, LOGAN UTAH 84321

REVISIONS		
NO.	DATE	DESCRIPTION

DATE: 03.08.19
JOB NO.:
SCALE: 3/16"=1'-0"
DRAWN: JCW

SHEET
A002



A1 MAIN STREET ELEVATION

SCALE: 3/16"=1'-0"

FLYNN STATE UNIVERSITY

