



**MURRAY CITY MUNICIPAL COUNCIL
COUNCIL INITIATIVE WORKSHOP**

A Murray City Council Initiative Workshop was held on Tuesday, March 3, 2015 in the Murray City Center, Conference Room #107, 5025 South State Street, Murray, Utah.

Members in Attendance:

Blair Camp	Council Chairman
Brett Hales	Council Member
Diane Turner	Council Member
Dave Nicponski	Council Member
Jim Brass	Council Member - Excused

Others in Attendance:

Frank Nakamura	City Attorney	Janet M. Lopez	Council Administrator
Jan Wells	Chief Administrative Officer	Janet Towers	Executive Asst. to the Mayor
Tim Tingey	ADS Director	Ted Eyre	Mayor
Craig Burnett	Police Chief	Kellie Challburg	Council Office
Jennifer Kennedy	Recorder	Charles Turner	Resident
Sophia Jackson	Utah Clean Cities- UCC	Kenny Harvey	UCC/Lancer
Vicki Bennett	Salt Lake City	Jeff Jackson	West Valley City
Casey Hill	University of Idaho	Randy Williams	Salt Lake County Health
Scott Brandeberry	UCC		

Chairman Camp called the Council Initiative Workshop to order and welcomed those in attendance. He excused Jim Brass who was not present.

Business Item #1

Discussion related to Idling Restrictions in Murray City Limits- Diane Turner

Ms. Turner stated that the purpose of this Council Initiative Workshop was to consider the possibility of creating a City ordinance regarding vehicle idling in Murray. She added that Salt Lake, South Salt Lake, and Holladay have idling ordinances in place. She said both South Salt Lake and Holladay have based their ordinances on the Salt Lake City ordinance.

Ms. Turner invited Robin Erickson, the Executive Director of Utah Clean Cities (UCC) to present at the meeting. Unfortunately, she was unable to attend but sent Sophia Jackson and Scott Brandeberry in her place. Ms. Turner also introduced Vicki Bennett, the Sustainability Director with Salt Lake City. Ms. Bennett would speak about the Salt Lake City ordinance, citizen response, and enforcement issues.

Ms. Jackson stated that Utah Clean Cities (UCC) has a program called, *Turn the Key, Be Idle-Free*. The main focus is on vehicle idling at the elementary schools, but also vehicle idling in general. Utah Clean Cities is one of nearly 100 similar entities throughout the nation. Clean Cities is a program under the Department of Energy. The mission is to advance the energy, economic and environmental security of the United States by reducing our petroleum use.

Idling is running your vehicle engine when the vehicle is not moving. It is completely unnecessary, but has become a habit, stated Ms. Jackson. It is often done to warm up your car, or to cool it off before starting driving. People also idle for power purposes, particularly work trucks that idle to keep certain machines running.

Idling consumes about 4% of oil imports in the U.S. and accounts for one half of the fuel loss for everyday drivers.

Idle-free offers a triple beneficial bottom line: sustainability, money savings, and improving overall health and the environment. She stated that there are studies that idling actually causes cancers and asthma issues in children, and is why the main focus is on children. She stated that idling actually wastes a lot of gas, and less idling occurs when the price of gas goes up. Idling also contributes to the poor air quality in the Wasatch Front.

There are over 100 initiatives throughout the country regarding idle free, whether they are laws, incentives, or programs. It has become a huge issue over the last ten years, she noted. She presented a map showing the states that had idling laws, including Utah.

She stated that the light-duty vehicles manufactured in 1996 to 2009, waste two gallons of fuel if idled for an hour. Newer vehicles lose one gallon of fuel if idled for one hour. Diesel vehicles lose three gallons of fuel in an hour and heavy-duty diesel trucks lose quite a bit more. The majority of fuel loss due to idling is caused by waiting, or dropping deliveries off. She asked Kenny Harvey to discuss the numbers from Rio Tinto, and their idle-free program. Rio Tinto is a stakeholder in Utah Clean Cities.

Mr. Harvey stated that he used to work at Rio Tinto and helped develop their idle program in 2008, after being approached by Robin Erickson. From the beginning of the program to 2014, Rio Tinto saved \$14 million in fuel costs alone, and reduced greenhouse gasses by 43,804 tons. He noted that setting up numbers and getting baselines was critical to track the idle reductions and see the benefits in fuel reduction, greenhouse gas reduction, and in maintenance costs also.

Ms. Jackson stated that UCC turns in an annual report to the Department of Energy (DOE). In 2013, in Utah, due to a reduction in idling, 14,000 tons of greenhouse gasses were reduced. Those were impressive numbers, and Utah Clean Cities was recognized nationally. Utah is actually one of the leaders

in idle reduction, she noted.

Idle free programs can be really easy or really difficult to get started. There needs to be a goal that states the reason for doing it, and how much you would like to reduce, either by minutes, or greenhouse gas tons. The data needs to be collected on how much fuel is currently being used, and what could be done to improve. The correct facts need to be used educationally to show people the results and how it is benefitting the City.

People don't like to change their habits, she mentioned. It may seem difficult at first but it is a great program and if people can see the triple bottom line benefit, then they can start to change. She said employees need to be accountable and everyone needs to recognize the fact that our cars do idle and we should be accountable also.

Ms. Jackson noted that Questar has its own idle-free program; they are supposed to turn off their cars and it is monitored. They have had great success with their program.

There is new technology and devices that can be implemented with vehicle idling. She asked Mr. Brandeberry to comment on the technology. Mr. Brandeberry stated that there is a lot of new technology emerging specifically for idle-free programs. There are auxiliary powered units that are placed in the trunk of a public service car, for example. The auxiliary battery runs on a deep cell battery that emits a very low discharge. This auxiliary unit would allow an officer or employee to turn off their vehicle and still run electrical power, up to 66 minutes.

Another technology is idling timers. If your car is in park and idling, the timer can be programmed to shut the car off automatically. The timer would have a set time, for example, two minutes, and would actually shut the car down if that time was exceeded.

There are automatic start/stop controls. This technology is very similar to that found in the new hybrids. The vehicle will automatically stop, if at a stop light, for example and would restart when the accelerator is pressed.

There is a hybrid drive-train that is found in hybrid cars. This technology allows the vehicle to run on battery for up to 10 miles per hour, or while idling. This involves the hybrid auxiliary unit, which is actually charged by the braking of the car. When you brake the vehicle, it charges the battery and gives energy back when the car is stopped.

Electrified parking spaces are becoming available, especially at truck stops. You can pull in and run your air conditioner or other items; ambulances can run all of their equipment by plugging into these spaces.

A lot of people are using the GPS technology and a company can track the driver, and if he is idling more than two minutes, an automatic text or call would be sent to the driver asking him to turn off his vehicle. He said the return on investment on any of these new anti-idling technologies is very reasonable, and they are proving to be very helpful.

Ms. Jackson added that Rocky Mountain Power recently installed the GPS based idling tracking technology system and had seen a lot of success. Mr. Brandeberry added that Rocky Mountain Power ordered their bucket trucks to run off a plug-in electric battery. When the employee reaches the light pole or emergency, they can shut the vehicle off, still run emergency lights and the bucket truck, electrically, while not running the vehicle. They just purchased four of those electric battery units.

Ms. Jackson said that there are great local resources.UCAIR is a huge advocate for anti-idling and have billboards, commercials and social media platforms. The Salt Lake Chamber is also a huge advocate, as is UCC. UCC receives a lot of the data from national labs, such as ARGON, EPA and other resources. Utah Clean Cities sponsors an idle-free conference every January. She asked if there were any questions.

Chairman Camp commented that this presentation seemed more centered towards the consumer, and the City as a consumer, with its own fleet. He asked what role the City would like to take as an ordinance regarding the citizens. Ms. Turner noted that may be a good question for Vicki Bennett with Salt Lake City.

Mayor Eyre asked for clarification on turning the car on and off, and if there is an increase in maintenance costs. He asked if it had a negative impact on the vehicle starter. Mr. Brandeberry replied that often when a car sits, it doesn't burn fuel efficiently and causes a fuel soak that gets into the oil and causes buildup in the valves. Also, manufacturers now are beginning to track engine idling hours on a vehicle, and warranties can be voided if the car is heavily idled, he said. Even though the odometer had low miles, if the engine hours are high from idling, the engine warranty could be lost. He added that when a vehicle idles, the spark plugs, and other components are still operating while idling. He said the stops and starts might add \$10 per year to the starter component, and may cause the starter to be replaced one year earlier; but the fuel pump, spark plugs, electronic items would have longer lives.

Mayor Eyre asked about Rocky Mountain Power and how they access the electrical power from a light pole to generate the battery in a bucket truck. Mr. Brandeberry clarified that they are not using that electrical power, but rather charging stations at the base. He added that there is an override switch in case of emergencies, or if the battery was depleted, they could switch it and run it from the power in the truck.

Mayor Eyre asked about signage in the City and if the signs are most effective near schools, or if there are restrictions regarding placing signs in commercial establishments. Ms. Turner said the other cities included the signage portion as part of the ordinance, and established where they could be located. She added that Ms. Bennett could address that question also.

Mayor Eyre asked how long Salt Lake and the other cities have had this ordinance in place. Ms. Turner asked Ms. Bennett to speak.

Ms. Bennett introduced herself as the Sustainability Director for Salt Lake City. Salt Lake City started with an Executive Order for all city vehicles, and employees stating that they should not idle. Ms. Turner stated that Murray already had an Executive Order for City vehicles. Ms. Bennett said that Salt Lake City used GPS technology on City vehicles, especially those that travelled distances and had the ability to

make choices. By tracking the vehicle's location and the idling, fuel usage was reduced by 20 to 30% per vehicle. It wasn't a negative thing for the employees, but they were aware that someone was watching.

The first steps were internal, then the City moved forward and partnered with Utah Clean Cities. The primary focus was on the schools. At the schools, there was the ability to reach the children, the parents, and attempt to get them to understand the reasoning behind this, particularly the impact on the health of the children. The effects right around a school can be measured, and the impact can be shown. There was a lot of education done, and notes were sent home with the children. All of the Salt Lake City schools have anti-idling signs. Mr. Nicponski asked if there was a measurable decrease of pollutants around the schools. Ms. Bennett said air quality tests were done, and there was still carbon monoxide in pockets where the kids were coming in and out. The sampling was done before and after parents arrived and began idling, and there was a visible difference, she stated.

The next step was to bring this issue to a larger population throughout the City. There was a lot of public outreach done with a lot of public input. The City then passed an ordinance, making idling a similar violation as a parking ticket. It is enforced by the parking enforcement division. They were supposed to give a citation after they see someone idling for more than two minutes.

Ms. Bennett said shortly after the ordinance passed, the State Legislature decided to get involved. They had some complaints, mainly from a limo driver that didn't like the idea that he could not idle his vehicle for long periods of time. The State Legislature passed a law regulating idling ordinances in the State. Their additional requirements stated that a ticket could only be issued, after three warnings were given. She noted that the chances of finding the same person idling four times, are very slim. She said the City had not made a penny from the ordinance. Warnings have been given, which is the goal, to educate people. The goal was never to make money, she noted. The goal was to have signs up and let people know not to idle.

She said the ordinance included that the City could enforce the violation anywhere in the City that the public would go, including: parking lots, drive thru restaurants, banks, etc. The Legislature added to their law that if a facility puts up an anti-idling sign on their property, then the ordinance would not be enforced on their property, and warnings or tickets would not be issued.

The current educational push is the *two-minute limit* platform. Education always needs to continue and to be renewed. The City is approaching facilities that do not have the signs up and asking them to participate. The signs are on City streets, parks and recreation centers. Mr. Nicponski clarified that the private entity needs to give permission to allow the signs on their property. Ms. Bennett said that was correct. She added that it is State law that if the facility has a sign up, the City cannot enforce idling citations on that property. She stated that the restaurant association picked up many signs and distributed them at their restaurants. Ms. Bennett said residents are more aware of idling, and also monitor and watch City vehicles if they are seen idling.

Ms. Turner asked if the schools were receptive in the initial push for the anti-idling program. Ms. Bennett confirmed that and recommended looking at the UCC website and listening to a great song that the kids did at Morningside Elementary. She added that the program had been in place almost three

years.

Mr. Hales asked what the response was from law enforcement, and if it was an additional burden on them. He said if there is a law on the books, it needed to be enforced. He asked for clarification on the violation being criminal and not civil. Chairman Camp noted that Murray doesn't have a civil court, like Salt Lake City. Mr. Nakamura added that it has to do with Legislation 10-37-03. Murray City cannot impose a civil penalty for municipal violations. That was enacted after Salt Lake City and West Valley had already established their civil processes. He stated that in Murray, it would have to be a crime, and be prosecuted as a crime in Justice Court. He said the City could create a civil process but could not have a civil penalty.

Chairman Camp commented that Salt Lake City has the parking enforcement department issue the warnings and citations. Murray doesn't have a parking enforcement team, only the Police Department. He asked Chief Burnett to comment on that, and what kind of burden it would impose on the department. Chief Burnett said the questions are where, when, how, whether it be public property, etc. He said that Murray would have to utilize the patrol officers and they would have to write regular citations that are tracked through the system. He asked how much time it would require to enforce it and said it would fall on the patrol officers, with no one officer dedicated to that issue. He said he is concerned about the time it would take to enforce the ordinance. It would be a low priority call for the officer and might take some time for the officer to get there.

Mr. Brandeberry asked how the City handles a littering law. Chief Burnett said parking tickets are similar to that and the City cannot write parking tickets because there is not a civil process. He said the officer would have to find the owner of the vehicle or wait for them to return. If the officer puts a parking citation on the parked car, a person could throw it away and there would be no follow up. He noted that the honest people are punished in that situation. He said the ordinance is enforceable, but there are many questions to be answered.

Mr. Nakamura added that there are so many exceptions, it becomes a burden to put on the Police Department. There could be exceptions in extreme weather or other situations. He added that the Police Department is very busy and he believes that if the law is on the books, then the City should be expected to enforce it.

Ms. Turner said she spoke with a council member from Holladay City and asked them how they enforce the ordinance that is on their books. He said it has not been enforceable and they knew it would not be. He said the goal was to get the message out and make people pay attention. He said there had not been a negative response from the community, and he believes people are more aware, she commented.

Mr. Hales stated that he loves the idea of educating people, but is there a way to do that, without making it an ordinance. He likes the concept of reducing idling. Chairman Camp said that the information showed that Summit County, and West Valley had done proclamations. He stated that a resolution could be done supporting public education, but it wouldn't give penalties and require enforcement by the Police. It still would give the City the opportunity to have a program and educate the citizens. Ms. Bennett said the first signs the City put up were the circular ones that stated, *turn the*

key, be idle-free. There was no time limit or ordinance, simply public education. Ms. Turner asked why the decision to move forward with an ordinance. Ms. Bennett said to put a little bit of teeth into the issue. She said there were complaints about truckers sitting and idling for long period of times, and the ordinance gave them the ability to act on some things. She added that those instances are not common, and there have probably only been a couple dozen.

Chairman Camp agreed with Mr. Nakamura that the number of possible exceptions make the issue hard to measure success in the public. He said he supports the education but believes it is bad policy to have an ordinance that the City has no intent of enforcing, and doesn't have the ability to enforce. Ms. Turner said the ordinance would let people know that it is an issue that the City takes seriously.

Mayor Eyre mentioned the concept of "big brother." He said the City receives phone calls asking why the City is being the "big brother", and also calls that a police car was seen idling. He asked Ms. Bennett her reaction to that. Ms. Bennett said that Salt Lake City is often the City that takes action first in the State, and puts their toe in the water first to test things out. She said they thought this one was worthwhile to move forward, especially with the air quality issues. She said that the City felt like the Legislature was the "big brother" when they modified the law, and limited what the City could do. She agreed that the City expended a little political capital but believes it was a good compromise. She believes they are in a good spot with the ability to ask citizens not to idle, but an ordinance is in place if needed.

Chairman Camp asked for thoughts from the Council. Mr. Hales said he would support education on the issue, but not an ordinance. Ms. Turner commented that it would be a good starting place. Ms. Bennett offered resources for printing signs, etc. Mr. Brandeberry commented that there are three idle-free classes given every year, and are open to the public. Ms. Turner said there is also an education piece done in the Murray Journal, to educate the community on idling and other environmental issues. Ms. Turner stated that she would like this group to present to a School Board meeting and see if they could get something going there. Ms. Bennett said that they offered the education to all the school districts in the valley, not just Salt Lake City. Mr. Nicponski said he supports a campaign, but doesn't want the resources of the law enforcement officers tapped beyond what their capabilities are. Ms. Turner said she appreciates the comments and would not give the issue up, and would keep working on it.

Chairman Camp thanked the presenters and adjourned the meeting.

Council Office Administrator II
Kellie Challburg