

CCJJ COMMISSION MINUTES – APPROVED

Committee	Commission on Criminal and Juvenile Justice
Date	Tuesday, February 17th, 2026
Time	12 PM – 2 PM
Location	Hybrid Zoom Virtual meeting – CCJJ Large Conference
Members Present	<p><u>In-Person Attendance</u>: Michael Dreschel (for Ron Gordon), Spencer Turley (for Jared Garcia), Tyler Kotter (for Commissioner Beau Mason), Stewart Young, Sheriff Chad Jensen, Blake Hills, Pam Vickrey, Richard Mauro, Ryan Robinson, Mark Moffat, Tom Ross, April Graham, Judge Jeremiah Humes</p> <p><u>Virtual Attendance</u>: Eric Tadehara (for Tracey Gruber), Chief Craig Black, Sariah Donnahoo (JJOC), Amanda Bollinger, Judge Ryan Peters</p>
Staff & Visitors	<p><u>Staff</u>: Danica Bodley, Elizabeth Klc, Dan Strong, Van Nguyen, Dr. Michele Leslie, Morgan Williams, Matthew Barraza, Mei Xue (virtual), Kara Hetrick (virtual), Rachelle Hill (virtual), Marlesse Jones, Ken Matthews (virtual), Katie Fox (virtual), Bud Powell (virtual), Chyleen Richey (virtual), Angelo Perillo (virtual), Ben Peterson (virtual)</p> <p><u>Visitors</u>: Brett Robinson, Raechel Lizon (virtual), Brittany Karzen, Erin Jemison, Steve Burton</p>
Agenda Item	Welcome and Approval of Meeting Minutes – Sheriff Chad Jensen, Commission Chair
Notes	<p>Tom Ross brings the commission meeting into session.</p> <p>The commission reviewed the previous meeting minutes from February 9th, 2026.</p> <p>Motion: Stewart Young motions for the commission to approve the minutes as presented. Spencer Turley (for Jared Garcia) seconds the motion. The motion passed unanimously.</p>
Agenda Item	2026 Legislative Session Bill Review and Vote
Notes	<p>The Commission reviewed the Consent List for week 5 of the 2026 Legislative Session.</p> <p>Motion: Stewart Young motions for the commission to adopt the positions of the consent list for week four. Tyler Kotter (for Commissioner Beau Mason) seconds the motion. The motion passed unanimously.</p> <p>The following sections detail the Commission's analysis of specific bills, organized by thematic impact on the criminal justice system.</p> <p><u>SB0233S1 Judicial Performance Evaluation Amendments</u></p> <p><i>1st sub allows votes to remain confidential and includes a study on whether the number of times that a judge is overturned on appeal for an abuse of discretion should be included in a judicial performance evaluation.</i></p> <p>The primary conflict surrounding SB0233S1 involved a new requirement for judicial performance evaluations to include performance standards for appellate decision-making timelines.</p> <p>Michael Dreschel (representing Ron Gordon) argued the bill constitutes a separation of powers issue. He stated that because rule 3-101 of the judicial administration already governs case processing, legislative interference runs afoul of Article 8 of the Utah Constitution.</p>

The bill proposes expanding the survey pool for judicial evaluations to include individuals who have appeared before the judge as a party (e.g., defendants in criminal cases).

Some members questioned the practicality of these surveys. Judge Jeremiah Humes noted that litigants often have "emotions that are very high" and may not appreciate a judge's long-term legal horizons in sensitive cases like child custody.

Motion: Tom Ross motions for the commission to support Senate Bill 233 Sub 01. Blake Hills seconds the motion. The motion **fails**. (4-4-6)

Support(s): Four (4) Supports; Spencer Turley (for Jared Garcia), Stewart Young, Blake Hills, Tom Ross

Opposition(s): Four (4) Oppositions; Michael Dreschel (for Ron Gordon), Chief Craig Black, Richard Mauro, Mark Moffat,

Abstention(s): Six (6) Abstentions; Tyler Kotter (for Commissioner Beau Mason), Pam Vickrey, Sariah Donnahoo (JJOC), Ryan Robinson, Amanda Bollinger, April Graham

Motion: Chief Craig Black motions for the commission to oppose Senate Bill 233 Sub 01. Richard Mauro seconds the motion. The motion **fails**. (4-2-8)

Support(s): Four (4) Supports; Michael Dreschel (for Ron Gordon), Chief Craig Black, Richard Mauro, Mark Moffat

Opposition(s): Two (2) Oppositions; Stewart Young, Blake Hills

Abstention(s): Eight (8) Abstentions; Spencer Turley (for Jared Garcia), Tyler Kotter (for Commissioner Beau Mason), Pam Vickrey, Sariah Donnahoo, Ryan Robinson, Tom Ross, Amanda Bollinger, April Graham

Motion: Tom Ross motions for the commission to hold on Senate Bill 233 Sub 01. Spencer Turley (for Jared Garcia) seconds the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

SJR010 Joint Resolution Amending Court Rules Regarding Jury Selection

Amends Rule 17.5 of the Utah Rules of Criminal Procedure to address an exception for jury selection in a felony case;

Amends Rule 18 of the Utah Rules of Criminal Procedure to address jury selection in a felony case

SJR010 addresses the transition from virtual jury selection (implemented during the pandemic) back to in-person selection.

Discussion centered on whether jury selection should default to in-person unless both parties agree to go virtual. The courts favored flexibility, with Judge Ryan Peters noting that virtual selection is essential for rural districts where jurors may have to drive two and a half hours to a courthouse.

Michael Dreschel reported that in a recent case, virtual selection allowed for 1,700 jurors to be screened via a 95-question spreadsheet, allowing for the dismissal of many "for cause" before they ever reached a courtroom.

Mark Moffat noted that while in-person selection has merit, the "cattle call" nature of in-person pools makes it difficult to use the extensive questionnaires that help defense attorneys select fair juries.

Motion: Ryan Robin motions for the commission to support in concept for Senate Joint Resolution 10 for further discussion and action. Chief Craig Black seconds the motion. The motion **passed**. (10-2-2)

Support(s): Ten (10) Supports; Eric Tadehara (for Tracy Gruber), Tyler Kotter (for Commissioner Beau Mason), Stewart Young, Chief Craig Black, Blake Hills, Richard Mauro, Ryan Robinson, Mark Moffat, April Graham

Opposition(s): Two (2) Oppositions; Michael Dreschel (for Ron Gordon), Spencer Turley (for Jared Garcia)

Abstention(s): Two (2) Abstentions; Pam Vickrey, Sariah Donnahoo

Eric Tadehara (for Tracy Gruber) has joined the call (after the support in concept motion was made).

Amanda Bollinger has left the meeting (after the support in concept motion was made, but before final motion could be taken).

Sheriff Chad Jensen has joined the meeting.

HB0274S2 Sentencing Commission Amendments

2nd sub: 3 collapsed defense attorney (with 1 rural), 3 prosecutors (with 1 rural), 3 sheriffs, jjoc moved to a non-voting member

HB0274S2 represents a major shift in how the Sentencing Commission is structured and how it establishes guidelines. The bill reconfigures the commission to include three defense attorneys (one rural), three prosecutors (one rural), and three sheriffs. The bill mandates that for violent felonies and sex offenses, the commission must make "protection of the public" the primary criterion, above the interests of the defendant.

Richard Mauro and Mark Moffat opposed the language, arguing it "channels judicial discretion" and departs from federal standards (18 USC 3553A) where no single factor is legally preferred over others. Mauro argued that all factors, including rehabilitation, should be weighted equally to maintain effective sentencing policy.

Motion: Tom Ross motions for the commission to support House Bill 274 Sub 02. Ryan Robinson seconds the motion. The motion **passed**. (12-2-1)

Support(s): Twelve (12) Supports; Michael Dreschel (for Ron Gordon), Spencer Turley (for Jared Garcia), Tyler Kotter (for Commissioner Beau Mason), Stewart Young, Chief Craig Black, Sheriff Chad Jensen, Blake Hills, Pam Vickrey, Ryan Robinson, Tom Ross, April Graham

Opposition(s): Two (2) Oppositions; Richard Mauro, Mark Moffat

Abstention(s): One (1) Abstention; Sariah Donnahoo (JJOC)

HCR002S1 Concurrent Resolution Authorizing Adult Sentencing and Supervision Length Guidelines and Juvenile Disposition Guidelines

This resolution authorizes the adult sentencing and supervision length guidelines and the juvenile disposition guidelines.

The commission priority supported House Concurrent Resolution 02 before Substitution 01.

Motion: Ryan Robinson motions for the commission to priority support House Concurrent Resolution 02 Sub 01. Stewart Young seconds the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

Judge Ryan Peters has left the meeting.

HB0188S2 Juvenile Justice Amendments

2nd sub: Requires CCJJ in collaboration with Youth Court Board to collect recidivism data on youth courts

The debate over HB0188S2 highlighted a disconnect between data-driven policy and practitioner experience.

Prosecutors (Meghan Mills) argued that the current system lacks accountability, citing instances of youth with dozens of non-judicial adjustments (NJAs) for serious offenses, such as domestic violence, before being petitioned. Pam Vickrey contended that the bill is a "moving target" based on misperceptions. She noted that recidivism for NJAs is lower than for the petition path and that the data does not support the need for mandated law enforcement referrals.

A significant portion of the bill requires recidivism data collection for youth courts. Van Nguyen noted the difficulty of this task, as many of the 28 youth courts across the state currently collect only aggregate data via spreadsheets and emails.

Motion: Tom Ross motions for the commission to oppose House Bill 188 Sub 01. The motion was not seconded.

Tyler Kotter (for Commissioner Beau Mason) makes a friendly amendment for the commission to support in concept, rather than oppose.

Motion: Tyler Kotter (for Commissioner Beau Mason) motions for the commission to support in concept for House Bill 188 Sub 01. Chief Craig Black seconds the motion. The motion **passed**. (10-4-1)

Support(s): Ten (10) Supports; Michael Dreschel (for Ron Gordon), Spencer Turley (for Jared Garcia), Tyler Kotter (for Commissioner Beau Mason), Stewart Young, Chief Craig Black, Sheriff Chad Jensen, Blake Hills, Pam Vickrey, Ryan Robinson, April Graham

Opposition(s): Four (4) Oppositions; Richard Mauro, Tom Ross, Mark Moffat, Sariah Donnahoo (JJOC)

Abstention(s): One (1) Abstention; Eric Tadehara (for Tracy Gruber)

Pam Vickrey has left the meeting.

Tom Ross has stepped out of the meeting.

HB0088 Public Assistance Amendments

Sub 2 provides an exception to governmental immunity; requires an agency or department to conduct certain audits; provides that the Office of the Legislative Auditor General may conduct a certain audit under certain circumstances; allows a certain individual a private right of action against a certain governmental employee under certain circumstances; provides for criminal or civil penalties under certain circumstances

HB0088 proposes strict verification of "lawful presence" for anyone receiving public benefits, including victim services and non-emergency medical care.

The Commission expressed alarm over the provision making it a Class B misdemeanor for a government employee to knowingly fail to verify citizenship before providing a service. Members noted that denying services to undocumented victims would make that population more vulnerable to "predators and criminals" and discourage cooperation with law enforcement.

Sheriff Chad Jensen raised concerns that withholding services like immunizations based on citizenship status would jeopardize the health of the broader population and increase the spread of disease.

Motion: Chief Craig Black motions for the commission to oppose House Bill 88. Richard Mauro seconds the motion. The motion **passed**. (8-0-6)

Support(s): Eight (8) Supports; Michael Dreschel (for Ron Gordon), Eric Tadehara (for Tracy Gruber), Stewart Young, Chief Craig Black, Richard Mauro, Ryan Robinson, Mark Moffat, April Graham

Abstention(s): Six (6) Abstentions; Tom Ross, Spencer Turley (for Jared Garcia), Tyler Kotter (for Commissioner Beau Mason), Sheriff Chad Jensen, Blake Hills, Sariah Donnahoo (JJOC)

SB0092 Prosecution Amendments

Amends the prohibition on a subsequent prosecution, creating an exception allowing a subsequent homicide prosecution if an individual was previously prosecuted for an offense resulting in bodily injury to an individual and the individual later died as a proximate result of the injury, if the death occurred after the original prosecution resulted in a conviction, dismissal, or acquittal.

Motion: No formal motion was made. The commission remains at a support in concept for Senate Bill 92.

Agenda Item	Other Business
Notes	No other business was addressed.
Agenda Item	Public Comment

Notes	Public comment time was given but none was shared.
Agenda Item	Adjourn
Notes	<p>Motion: Tyler Kotter (for Commissioner Beau Mason) motions for the commission to adjourn. Ryan Robinson seconds the motion. The motion passed unanimously. The commission adjourns.</p> <p>The next meeting is scheduled for Monday, February 23rd, 2026 from Noon-2 PM. Location: <u>Anchor Location:</u> CCJJ Offices Zoom link: meet.google.com/sbq-pstg-mod</p>
DISCLAIMER	Please note that these meeting minutes have been primarily generated or assisted by an artificial intelligence (AI) tool. These notes have been edited by staff to ensure accuracy and completeness.