

ALPINE CITY PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING
Alpine City Hall, 20 North Main, Alpine, UT
July 29, 2025

I. GENERAL BUSINESS

- A. Welcome and Roll Call:** The meeting was called to order at 6:00 p.m. by Alan Macdonald.
The following were present and constituted a quorum:

Chair: Alan Macdonald

Commission Members: Troy Slade, Michelle Schirmer, Jeff Davis, John MacKay

Excused: Greg Butterfield, Susan Whittenburg

Staff: Ryan Robinson, Marla Fox

Others:

B. Prayer/Opening Comments: Michelle Schirmer

C. Pledge of Allegiance: John MacKay

II. REPORTS AND PRESENTATIONS

None

III. ACTION ITEMS

A. Review of Proposed Guest House for Newell Whitney located at 747 W Ranch Circle

Ryan Robinson said A proposal has been submitted to construct a guest house on the property located at 747 W Ranch Circle. The property, owned by Newell Whitney, is just over five acres in size. The proposed guest house would be located over 120 feet from the main dwelling, more than 200 feet from the rear property line, with side yard setbacks of 40 feet on the west side and over 216 feet on the east side. These setbacks exceed the minimum requirements established in the Alpine Development Code for a guest house.

The property is within the CR-40,000 zone, where guest houses are permitted through a Conditional Use Permit (CUP). Additional requirements and review criteria for such uses are outlined in Section 3.23.060 of the Alpine Development Code.

City staff have reviewed the application under the standards in Section 3.23 and found that the proposal complies with all applicable requirements. Because guest houses are a conditional use in this zone, the City may impose additional conditions to mitigate any potential detrimental effects of the proposed use.

If the City Council approves this application, City staff and the Building Department will conduct further review for compliance with setbacks, building height, and all applicable building code requirements during the building permit process.

The applicant will have to purchase a half-acre of water and record it to the property.

Ryan Robinson said there is a wooded area where the home would be built. The lots are large and buffered from each other. He said there haven't been any complaints about this application.

Troy Slade asked what the rules were for a guest house. Ryan Robinson said the property must be owner occupied, the home is to be used by a single family, with no commercial use of the home or rentals under thirty days. Our code does allow for long-term rentals of the guest house.

MOTION: Planning Commission member Troy Slade moved to recommend approval of the proposed guest house located at 747 W Ranch Circle.

Jeff Davis seconded the motion. There were 5 Ayes and 0 Nays (recorded below). The motion passed.

Ayes:

Michelle Schirmer
Troy Slade
Alan Macdonald
Jeff Davis
John MacKay

Nays:

Excused

Greg Butterfield
Susan Whittenburg

B. Public Hearing: Proposed Material change to Lambert Park: Adding a turnaround and parking area at the West end of Box Elder Way

Ryan Robinson said Jason Thelin and Jessica Smuin, as members of the City Council, has requested the construction of a turnaround area at the west end of Box Elder Way, located within Lambert Park. This turnaround would be similar to the one constructed at the east end of Moyle Drive, which is also in Lambert Park. The purpose of the turnaround is to provide additional parking, finish the road and create a safe area for vehicles to turn around, preventing them from continuing onto the emergency access road. It would also support visitors wishing to enjoy features of the park, such as the poppy fields, by allowing additional parking spaces.

The proposed turnaround area may be surfaced with either asphalt (preferred) or gravel and would accommodate approximately eleven (11) parking spaces. Existing flexible bollards would be relocated to the end of the new cul-de-sac to discourage non-emergency vehicle access through the park. Snowplow drivers would continue to plow through this area rather than attempting to plow the entire turnaround.

Staff is developing a design that complies with slope requirements outlined in *Alpine Development Code 4.07.090 – Road Grades*. Specifically, the slope leading to the cul-de-sac should not exceed 4% (the current design is approximately 10–11%), and the last 100 feet of the traveled surface should have a slope not exceeding 3%. The Fire Chief said to just make sure the fire trucks wouldn't high center or have any issues.

According to *Alpine Development Code 3.16.040*, any material changes to city-owned property require a public hearing before the Planning Commission prior to City Council consideration. The Planning Commission's role is to hold the public hearing and then make a recommendation to the City Council. Relevant considerations are outlined in *Section 3.16.090 – Maintenance and Improvements to Public Lands*.

In September of 2023, the Alpine City Council approved a Conservation Easement and Management Plan regarding Lambert Park. In the Management Plan, a unanimous vote of all members of the City Council is required to allow the addition of a paved parking area. If the parking area is not paved, the Alpine Development Code 3.16.040 requires four (4) positive votes from the City Council to approve a material change to city property.

CITY CODE REFERENCE

- Alpine Development Code 3.16.090 – Open Space Ordinance
 - All citizen requests for improvements and maintenance of city-owned property must be submitted in writing. These requests require a recommendation from the Planning Commission and approval by the City Council. Each request should include a written or drawn landscape design.

Approval is based on:

- Adherence to general and designated guidelines
 - Compliance with city ordinances
 - A site visit
- **Alpine Development Code 3.16.040 Special Provisions**
 - Land included in these parks shall not be materially changed, improved, altered, disposed of in any manner or used for any other purpose except after a recommendation of the Planning Commission following a public hearing and by a super majority vote of the City Council (4 positive votes out of 5 City Council members are required). A material change shall include, but is not limited to, a change to the park's present and essential defining characteristics, creation of or improvement of roadways or parking lots within the park.

John MacKay and Troy Slade asked to see on a map where this turnaround would be located.

Alan Macdonald asked how this will work with the conservation easement that was recently put in place and said we should look at the relevant language.

Alan Macdonald opened the Public Hearing.

Jason Thelin, City Councilman, said this has been in the budget for a couple of years now. He said this year it was voted unanimously to put it in. He said the road is currently a dead-end road that looks like you should be able to go down it. This new turnaround will define the area and finish it to allow for an area for cars to turn around. The conservation easement allows for modification for parking.

Jason Thelin said the issues are grade, can the fire department get in there and turn around. Is the water going to flow correctly. He said this is not intended to be a regular neighborhood cul-de-sac, but just a place to turn around. He said the grade may need an exception.

Alan Macdonald said the Planning Commission doesn't have the same authority as the City Council to grant exceptions. He said the grade is outside of the ordinance but said it is not an ordinary cul-de-sac. He said it's a struggle because the Planning Commission looks to see if it meets the ordinance and if it

doesn't, they should not approve it. He said he does not see anything in the ordinance that would grant an exception for Planning Commission to apply let alone the City Council.

Ryan Robinson said the code states that if the grade is over 3%, the City Council can grant an exception.

Jason Thelin asked for ideas from the Planning Commission on the trails that connect into the turnaround area. How will they slope, do they need to be retained by boulders, how can we make them look good, etc.

The Planning Commission had a discussion on how to make the motion because of the lack of exceptions in the ordinance.

Andrew Young, resident, said this is a tough decision and a simple solution is to kick this back to the City Council to make an exception. He said he knows Jason Thelin and Jessica Smuin really want to stop that road from going through. He said he would have liked to see resident input on this plan because people that live there have different views.

Sheryl Dain, resident, said she spends a lot of time in Lambert Park and wants to make sure the ability for all residents will be honored. She said it looked like there would be an impact to some of the walking trails.

Alan Macdonald closed the Public Hearing.

Alan Macdonald said we need to consider the language of the conservation easement because this requires an exception. He said he believed the language would allow for an encroachment into the park with a 4 person vote for gravel and a 5 person vote for a paved turnaround.

John MacKay said he has an issue with paving a small area of Lambert Park. He said it doesn't belong and he doesn't like it.

Jeff Davis said he is not in favor of this at all and is confused that we talked quite a bit about the slope which does not meet the requirements. He said we talked about a part of the code which applies to the maintenance of the area, and not the slope. He said he is concerned about the code and what is being proposed. He said he wanted an in-perpetuity easement. He does not support a parking area right in the middle of a walking trail. He said this is out of the way and doesn't make any sense.

John MacKay asked if the Planning Commission manages the conservation easement in Lambert Park. Ryan Robinson said no, it is the City Council. John MacKay said we can't make an informed recommendation without more information.

Alan Macdonald said this has already been budgeted for at the City Council level. Jason Thelin said Jed Muhlestein put a budget together two years ago but costs have probably gone up some.

John MacKay said he would like to see a detailed design, how a retaining wall would look and how do you get a walking trail through the retaining wall.

Michelle Schirmer said she doesn't see the reason to ruin trails to have parking next to homes that are not in the city. She said this doesn't meet the ordinance and would require an exception. She said it would ruin vegetation and would be used mainly for non-residents who live in the County.

Alan Macdonald asked what would be required for fill. Ryan Robinson said it would need to be raised but said he can't speak to it because he is not the engineer.

Troy Slade said he likes the gravel option but not the paved option. He asked if the purpose was for handicapped parking for the poppies. Jason Thelin said that is a secondary reason. The first reason is to visually give the road a stop area and a turnaround area to keep people from driving down the road.

Jeff Davis said regardless, the road has to be a road that is cleared, plowed, and drivable for emergencies.

MOTION: Planning Commission member Jeff Davis moved to recommend Denial of the proposed turnaround at the west end of Box Elder Way in Lambert Park, as presented, finding that the request does not meet the requirements of Alpine Development Code Section 3.16.090 or the Conservation Easement, and language was not found in the current ordinance to grades that allows for an exception to cul-de-sac turnarounds.

Michelle Schirmer seconded the motion. There were 4 Ayes and 1 Nays (recorded below). The motion passed.

Ayes:

Michelle Schirmer
Jeff Davis
Alan Macdonald
John MacKay

Nays:

Troy Slade

Excused

Greg Butterfield
Susan Whittenburg

IV. COMMUNICATIONS

Next Planning Commission meeting will be on August 19, 2025.

V. APPROVAL OF PLANNING COMMISSION MINUTES: July 1, 2025

MOTION: Planning Commissioner Jeff Davis moved to approve the minutes for July 1, 2025, as written.

Troy Slade seconded the motion. There were 5 Ayes and 0 Nays (recorded below). The motion passed.

Ayes:

Michelle Schirmer
Troy Slade
Alan Macdonald
Jeff Davis
John MacKay

Nays:

Excused:

Greg Butterfield
Susan Whittenburg

MOTION: Planning Commissioner Jeff Davis moved to adjourn the meeting.

Michelle Schirmer seconded the motion. There were 5 Ayes and 0 Nays (recorded below). The motion passed.

Ayes:

Michelle Schirmer
Troy Slade
Alan Macdonald
Jeff Davis
John MacKay

Nays:

Excused

Greg Butterfield
Susan Whittenburg

The meeting was adjourned at 7:55 p.m.